

COUNTY COUNCIL

WEDNESDAY, 19 JULY 2017

PRESENT: Councillor H.I. Jones (Chair)

Councillors:

S.M. Allen	L.R. Bowen	K.V. Broom	C.A. Campbell
J.M. Charles	S.A. Curry	A. Davies	C.A. Davies
G. Davies	H.L. Davies	I.W. Davies	J.A. Davies
S.L. Davies	T.A.J. Davies	W.R.A. Davies	E. Dole
J.S. Edmunds	P.M. Edwards	D.C. Evans	L.D. Evans
R.E. Evans	W.T. Evans	A.L. Fox	S.J.G. Gilasbey
T.M. Higgins	A.D. Harries	J.K. Howell	P.M. Hughes
P. Hughes-Griffiths	A. James	J.D. James	R. James
D.M. Jenkins	J.P. Jenkins	G.H. John	A.C.J. Jones
B.W. Jones	D. Jones	A. Lenny	K. Lloyd
K. Madge	S. Matthews	A.S.J. McPherson	A.G. Morgan
E. Morgan	S. Najmi	D. Nicholas	B.D.J. Phillips
J.S. Phillips	J.G. Prosser	E.M.J.G. Schiavone	H.B. Shepardson
L.M. Stephens	B. Thomas	D. Thomas	E.G. Thomas
G. Thomas	G.B. Thomas	J. Tremlett	A. Vaughan-Owen
D.E. Williams	D.T. Williams	J.E. Williams	

Also Present:

Mr M. James	- Chief Executive
Mr C. Moore	- Director of Corporate Services
Mr J. Morgan	- Director of Community Services
Mr P. Thomas	- Assistant Chief Executive
Mrs W. Walters	- Assistant Chief Executive
Mr S. Pilliner	- Head of Transportation & Highways
Mrs D. Hockenull	- Media & Marketing Manager
Mr S. Murphy	- Senior Solicitor
Mrs M. Evans	- Principal Democratic Services Officer
Thomas	

Chamber, County Hall, Carmarthen: 10.00 a.m. – 12.05 p.m.

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE.

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors F. Akhtar, D.M. Cundy, H.A.L. Evans, C.J. Harris, G. Jones, T.J. Jones, M.J.A. Lewis, D. Price, B.A.L. Roberts and A.D.T. Speake.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTERESTS.

Councillor	Minute number	Nature of Interest
------------	---------------	--------------------

S.L. Davies	11.2 – Executive Board Minutes 26 th June 2017 (minute 10 – Community Asset Transfer Update)	Secretary of Dafen Welfare Committee
J.D. James	11.2 – Executive Board Minutes 26 th June 2017 (minute 10 – Community Asset Transfer Update)	President of Burry Port Bowls Club and a member of Burry Port Rugby Club
The Chief Executive advised that declarations in relation to Community Asset Transfer where members are also members of Town or Community Councils are automatically recorded.		

3. CHAIR’S ANNOUNCEMENTS.

- The Chair extended condolences to Councillor Shirley Matthews and her family on the death of her father-in-law;
- Good luck and best wishes were extended to Cor Merched Sir Gar who would be representing Wales at the Eurovision Choir of the Year competition in Riga, Latvia the following Saturday. They are the only choir from the United Kingdom competing;
- Congratulations were extended to Logan Williams, a pupil at Ysgol Bro Dinefwr, who was the runner up representing Wales in the Junior World Sheepdog Handling Competition held over the weekend in the Netherlands;
- Congratulations were extended to Dewi Griffiths from Llanfynydd who won the Swansea Half Marathon last month. This was the 3rd time for him to win the race, finishing in 64 minutes.

4. MINUTES

4.1. 26TH APRIL, 2017

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting of Council held on the 26th April, 2017 be signed as a correct record.

4.2. 24TH MAY, 2017

Reference was made to minute no. 5 wherein the last paragraph should read “The Vice-Chair’s consort, Mrs Bethan Charles-Davies, was presented with a Chain of Office by the Chair’s consort, Mrs Jean Jones”.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting of Council held on the 24th May, 2017 be signed as a correct record, subject to the inclusion of the above-mentioned amendment.

5. PRESENTATION OF PETITION - PAVEMENT ON TYCROES ROAD

The Chair invited Councillor Tina Higgins to present the petition in the following terms, together with supporting remarks:-

“We residents of Tycroes call on Carmarthenshire County Council to provide a pavement on Tycroes Road from the entrance of Fforest Fach Estate to Gelli Lane. S106 funding of over £40,000 has already been secured and should be used before any further development in Parc Gwernen.”

The Chief Executive advised that the issue referred to in the Notice of Motion was an executive function and consequently Council was only able to refer the matter to the Executive Board for consideration.

RESOLVED that the petition be received and referred to the Executive Board for consideration.

6. NOTICE OF MOTION

Council considered the following Notice of Motion submitted by Councillor Rob James:-

“That this Council:-

- (a) reiterates its commitment to Carmarthenshire’s parks and green spaces;
- (b) believes that despite financial constraints the preservation of local parks and green spaces remains an essential duty;
- (c) recognises the importance of parks and green spaces to the health and wellbeing of adults and children in Carmarthenshire;
- (d) favours the development of brownfield land, rather than utilise green spaces, when considering building new assets;
- (e) supports the transfer of community assets to town/community/rural councils only where there is strong support from both the local community and the body receiving the asset.”

The Motion was duly seconded.

The proposer and seconder of the Motion were afforded the opportunity of speaking in support thereof and the proposer proceeded to outline the reasons for its submission, as set out in the Motion.

A number of statements were made both in support of and against the Motion.

The Chief Executive advised that the issue referred to in the Notice of Motion was an executive function and consequently, if the Motion was supported, Council was only able to refer the matter to the Executive Board for consideration.

Following a vote, it was

RESOLVED that the Notice of Motion be not supported.

7. QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS

7.1. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR PETER HUGHES-GRIFFITHS, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR CULTURE, SPORT AND TOURISM

“Could you state the reasons why Carmarthenshire Council have taken the decision to advertise for expressions of interest for a property transaction, rather than a competitive open tendering process to procure services in Parc Howard?”

Response by Councillor Peter Hughes-Griffiths, Executive Board Member for Culture, Sport & Tourism:-

“It is important for us to remember that Parc Howard in Llanelli includes the iconic building within the park and some 25 acres of land and gardens. If members have the opportunity please visit Parc Howard so that you can see for yourselves the treasure that we have as a county. It is wonderfully maintained and it is a very special place. There are lakes, there is a new adventure playground for children and there is a climbing installation to follow shortly and there is real potential for this popular park. You also have the museum full of treasures. Recently opened is the first of four orienteering trails where people can follow the markers, walk around the park and learn about the area at the same time. The museum service is operating in a landscape of unprecedented change and we as a Council have to accept the fact that change is inevitable. The days when we had plenty of money to run museums have gone and so we have to look for new and different ways of maintaining these treasures and that is our responsibility at Parc Howard. We need to look at the possibilities for the park and the mansion and as a first step we enquired to see who might be interested in helping us and expressions of interest were sought. Just to see if anyone had other ideas that we may not have thought of to complement the existing provision. It is an excellent place to stage an event and we wondered whether there might be local businesses who would like to help us. That was the first natural step to find out whether anyone might be interested in helping us and what the possibilities might be. Interest has been expressed and that is now being considered as we move on to develop this special asset for the benefit of the people of Llanelli, Carmarthenshire and anyone visiting from near and far and may I appeal for support and co-operation to ensure the success of Parc Howard.”

Councillor James asked the following supplementary question:-

“Within the Leader’s Annual Report that you gave last time you stated that you would be keen to retain Parc Howard in Council ownership by not using an open tendering process to bring companies in and keeping it in Council ownership. Residents and park users are in the dark about how much detail there is concerning this proposal. Can you at least state what length of lease you currently prefer as the Executive Board Member or as the Executive Board as a whole?”

Response by Councillor Peter Hughes-Griffiths, Executive Board Member for Culture, Sport & Tourism:-

“We have not reached that stage yet and when we do we will consider it. It depends on the type of interest that is shown, what aspects of interest are shown. There might be more than one that are helping us. We will do that when we reach that stage.”

7.2. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR JOHN JENKINS TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL

“Given the obvious and overwhelming opposition from the public in Llanelli to this Authority’s plan to replace a well-used tennis court in Parc Howard with a car park which will be accessed by a blatantly unsuitable access point via Old Road; regardless and separate from the planning process, would the Leader of the Council acknowledge that this element of the Parc Howard Masterplan is deeply unpopular and would he care to demonstrate his reasonableness and willingness to listen and engage with the community in Llanelli by withdrawing Planning Application number S/35541 if only pending meaningful public consultation, separate from the planning process, on the provision of car parking within the Parc Howard Masterplan?”

Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-

“The proposal for a car park at this location has been considered for many years and was part of the original masterplan for Parc Howard when the Heritage Lottery application was submitted in 2015. I have convened over the past 18 months/2 years a total of 6 meetings with representative groups to discuss plans and aspirations for the park in order to ensure that the park stays in public ownership. Those meetings included The Parc Howard Association, The Friends of Llanelli Museum, Llanelli Town Council, as well as the Llanelli Community Heritage. The proposals, including the need for a car park to support the sensitive commercialisation of Parc Howard, had received the general support of the representatives from those organisations and were then approved by the Executive Board on 26th July, 2016. The tennis court and games area are underused and we will still retain another tennis court behind the children’s play area. The access to the proposed parking area from Old Road has been designed by our own highway engineers and meets all design requirements for this type of facility. The car parking proposals have been drawn up on the basis originally envisaged in the Masterplan and are currently open to consultation as part of the planning process. I consider that the consultation with key groups has been more than “meaningful” and the planning process provides every opportunity for public comments on the proposals. I will not be withdrawing the application and will leave it for the Planning Committee to consider the public comments and determine the application in due course and expect them to do that on the basis of material planning considerations.”

Councillor Jenkins asked the following supplementary question:-

“Can you name just one organisation that has written in and said ‘we support the car park?’”

Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-

“All I am trying to do is to save Parc Howard. Parc Howard was on the Asset Transfer list. It was in your gift as a Town Councillor in Llanelli to accept that but Llanelli Town Council decided that they did not want to take the asset or Parc Howard. Then it came back to me and to this Council so then we had to do something which is why we sat down with the 4 groups I have outlined six times over 18 months in long conversations about how we do that, how we ensure that Parc Howard stays in public ownership. That’s a pledge I made in the second week of my leadership two and a half years ago and I have not moved from that.

It will stay in public ownership because it belongs to the people but in order to do that we need a plan and a part of that plan is that need for all the people of Llanelli to be able to use the park. Not just the people who are near to it, who can walk to it and it is convenient for them but for the people in Tyisha and for the people in Glanymor and for the people in Llwynhendy and for the people in the outlying areas. When my children were small we were there every weekend but we had to find somewhere to park about half a mile away. This is to ensure that the park is for all the people of Llanelli and not just for some and to ensure that that car park gives a viability to the possibility of some sort of income there that is meaningful in the context of the finances need to ensure that future. A comparative is to look at a similar park and I am thinking of Picton Castle in Pembrokeshire. Very similar with wonderful gardens surrounding it. Their parking spaces are 168 and they are hoping to expand to 288. Already with what they have done with the parking that means that their visitor numbers have increased from 15,000 to 31,000. That has doubled the use of the park. It is quite simple, when Llanelli Town Council said no to the asset, I said yes. I said that we will sit down together and we will devise a scheme that means that this park stays in public ownership. I want to keep it in public ownership for the people of Llanelli. We have heard this morning about the need for parks that are suitable for our youngsters and yet last week in a Planning Committee on a planning application on a piece of kit to go into Parc Howard for youngsters – 7 Councillors voted against it. What kind of people vote against a youth facility in a public park in their own ward and in their own town? That defies belief and Llanelli deserves better than that and deserves more consideration than that. I could talk about the park in Aberdare, which is similar again with car parking because they want all the people to be able to use the park as we do in Llanelli. Parc Howard is a jewel and we want to maintain it and keep it in public ownership.”

7.3. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR EDWARD THOMAS TO COUNCILLOR HAZEL EVANS, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT

“Carmarthen to Llandeilo Cycle Path – I wonder if you can please give us an update on this fantastic project, in particular when can we expect a start on the Llandeilo side of the cycle path. The Llandeilo side of the cycle path strikes me as being the easiest part of the path with fewer landlords to negotiate with.”

Response by Councillor David Jenkins, Executive Board Member for Resources [in the absence of Councillor Hazel Evans who was engaged in alternative Council business]

“Planning permission has been granted for ‘the Western section’ of the route which extends from Abergwili to Nantgaredig, and land negotiations are progressing positively. It is anticipated that a significant start of works on this section will take place during this financial year utilising WG Local Transport Grant awarded to the Council for 2017/18. Some 13 landowners are affected by the Western Section route. The majority are represented by agents. One plot has already been acquired, three are currently with legal and the remainder are subject to ongoing negotiations.

Coming to the Eastern section (Nantgaredig to Llandeilo), officers are in the process of submitting the necessary documentation to support a planning application. The aim being for the application to be submitted in time to be considered by September. In parallel with this officers are progressing positively

with land negotiations, particularly the principal landowner (The Golden Grove Estate) and detailed design of the Eastern section.

Some 15 land owners are involved on this side as opposed to 13 on the Westerns side. Direct contact and engagement has been made with all but 2 of the landowners. The Golden Grove Estate (Sir Edward Dashwood) represents approx. 64% of the route. There is one landowner that totally opposes the scheme so that is a hurdle we will have to get over. Planning and delivery of this scheme is proposed in several distinct phases.

One of the reasons for this is that the timing of any works will be heavily reliant on the availability of funding and land and whilst this makes it difficult to attribute a firm timescale for the delivery of any particular section, it is important that officers are in a position to react and deliver on the ground when land and funding affords the opportunity to do so. Therefore, whilst the draft works programme indicates works at the Llandeilo end are to be delivered in 2019/20 this could very well be brought forward in the event that these external factors fall into place.”

7.4. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ANDREW JAMES TO COUNCILLOR CEFIN CAMPBELL, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR COMMUNITIES AND RURAL AFFAIRS

“Carmarthenshire County Council is one of seven local authorities who nominate elected County Councillors to serve on the board of management of The Brecon Beacons National Park Authority. Representing Carmarthenshire on the Park are Cllrs Glynog Davies of Quarter Bach and myself for Llangadog Ward. The Brecon Beacons National Park in 2017 is celebrating its 60th Birthday and together with the fact that 2017 is promoted as the year of the Legends it is anticipated that large crowds of visitors will be flocking to the area. This is so appropriate considering that the local ward of Llangadog is closely linked to the legendary story of the “lady of the lake”. The stakeholders in the local area partnership are The Brecon Beacons National Park Authority, Welsh Water Authority and Carmarthenshire County Council. As a financial contribution has already been made from the first two parties, I therefore formally ask the question, will Carmarthenshire County Council also contribute financially to the expenditure that is needed to develop the local infrastructure within the area?”

Response by Councillor Cefin Campbell, Executive Board Member for Communities and Rural Affairs:-

“One can see what the challenges are. Clearly I am not in a position this morning to commit this Council to any specific expenditure on that part of the National Park but what I would suggest is that the Executive Board would perhaps be willing to hold meetings with the partners to which you refer namely the National Park, the Water Authority and ourselves as a Council so that we look to improve the site and we bring back a properly costed scheme and we then consider the way forward as a partnership of Authorities in order to make this section of land more attractive and easier to use in the future.”

7.5. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ANDREW JAMES TO COUNCILLOR HAZEL EVANS, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT

“On Friday 24th March, 2017, the recycling centre at Llangadog better known to the local community as All Waste Services closed its gates. The site in question is fit for purpose, is licenced with full planning to accommodate recycling in the north eastern side of the county. Furthermore the site is now on the market with the local estate agents. It is now nearly 3 months since the residents of Llangadog and the surrounding area have had to manage with basic and temporary recycling facilities, my question to Cllr Evans is – When and where will the recycling be returned to normal services?”

Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council [in the absence of Councillor Hazel Evans who was engaged in alternative Council business]

“Despite the Council undertaking extensive negotiations with All Waste Services with regard to the operation of the Llangadog Household Waste Recycling Centre, it was unfortunate that a mutually agreeable position could not be reached and at the contractors behest that facility closed in March 2017. Since then, the authority has received numerous requests for the provision of a similar facility in the area and requests for updates on the progression for such a facility. Following the closure of Llangadog, the Authority is undertaking a feasibility study with regard to Household Waste Recycling and Bring site provision within the county as a whole. The study will look at such factors as geographical location, population densities, proximity to other facilities and give a series of options for the Authority to consider. This study is likely to take a period of time while all the qualitative and quantitative information is gathered and assessed and is expected to have a recommendation for consideration in November this year. In the meantime the Authority is directing residents to utilise the bring site facilities in Llandovery for their segregated recyclate with containers for cans, paper and glass or alternatively the Household Waste Recycling Facility at Wernddu, near Ammanford. In addition, we are looking to organise further waste amnesties to aid residents within the area with their waste recycling and disposal needs. The Authority is aware that the site in Llangadog is for sale, however we are not currently negotiating with All Waste Services on this matter. The Council has been contacted with proposals for a number of sites in the locality and as part of the review all options will need to be considered.”

8. PUBLIC QUESTIONS

The Chair advised that no public questions had been received.

9. CORPORATE MANAGEMENT TEAM APPOINTMENTS

[NOTE: Mrs W. Walters, Assistant Chief Executive, left the meeting during consideration of this item.]

Council considered a report detailing proposals for the recruitment of a Director of Education & Children’s Services and a Director of Regeneration & Policy.

Following a previous recruitment exercise in November 2016 which elicited only 2 applications it was decided not to proceed to full appointment of a permanent Director of Education Services and interim arrangements were agreed pending a further recruitment exercise towards the end of the 2016/17 academic year.

In May 2015 a report was presented to County Council that set out a proposal for the realignment of the Authority's Senior Management Team. As part of those proposals, a new post of Assistant Chief Executive (Regeneration & Policy) was created. Since then the post has grown significantly to include additional responsibilities including key elements of the Corporate Property function. In addition to this, the £1.3 billion ground-breaking Swansea Bay City Deal has been approved and eleven major projects will now get underway, boosting the local economy by £1.8 billion and generate almost 10,000 new jobs over the next 15 years. Carmarthenshire County Council will be directly responsible for leading and managing the administration and compliance of projects worth £241m.

In light of the above it was proposed to create a post of Director of Regeneration & Policy to drive and support the work of the Joint Committee to progress the City Deal. This post would replace, and would not be additional to, the current post of Assistant Chief Executive (Regeneration & Policy) post, which would then be deemed redundant.

The Motion was duly moved and seconded.

The following Amendment was thereupon proposed and duly seconded:-

“In a step to ensure that the brightest and the best apply for the posts before us and to show our commitment to the promises that we made to the electorate we propose today that the two senior salaries carry a maximum salary of £112,211, bringing it in line with the City & County of Swansea.”

The proposer and seconder of the Amendment were afforded the opportunity of speaking in support thereof.

Reference was made to the fact that the Pay Policy Advisory Panel, which has cross-party membership, considered and agreed upon the Authority's pay policy statement earlier this year, which was subsequently approved by Council at its meeting held on 8th March, 2017.

Following a requisition by more than 10 members, in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 16.4, a recorded vote was taken on the amendment with the votes cast as follows:-

For the Amendment (18)

Councillors S. Curry, S.L. Davies, J.S. Edmunds, P.M. Edwards, D.C. Evans, A. Fox, T. Higgins, J.D. James, R. James, D. Jones, K. Lloyd, K. Madge, S. Matthews, A. McPherson, E. Morgan, S. Najmi, J. Prosser and Bill Thomas

Against the Amendment (32)

Councillors S.M. Allen, C.A. Campbell, G. Davies, H. Davies, I.W. Davies, J.A. Davies, T.A.J. Davies, W.R.A. Davies, E. Dole, L.D. Evans, R. Evans, W.T. Evans, K. Howell, P. Hughes-Griffiths, P.M. Hughes, A. James, D.M. Jenkins, A. Lenny, A.G. Morgan, D. Phillips, S. Phillips, E. Schiavone, H.B. Shepardson, L.M. Stephens, D. Thomas, E.G. Thomas, G. Thomas, G.B. Thomas, J. Tremlett, D.E. Williams, D. Williams and J.E. Williams.

Abstentions (14)

Councillors L. Bowen, K. Broom, J.M. Charles, A. Davies, C.A. Davies, J. Gilasbey, D. Harries, J.P. Jenkins, G. John, C. Jones, B. Jones, H.I. Jones, D. Nicholas and A. Vaughan-Owen.

RESOLVED that the Amendment to the Motion be not supported.

Council thereupon proceeded to vote on the substantive Motion and it was

FURTHER RESOLVED that

- 9.1 That the job profile and person specification for both the posts of Director of Education & Children’s Services and the Director of Regeneration & Policy (attached to the report as appendix 1 and 2) be endorsed;**
- 9.2 That the job adverts be endorsed in order to allow both posts to be publicly advertised, as required by the Local Authorities (Standing Orders)(Wales)(Amendment) Regulations 2014 (attached to the report as appendix 3 and 4.**

10. EXECUTIVE BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS

10.1. APPOINTMENT OF PROPER OFFICERS

Council was informed that the Executive Board, at its meeting held on the 26th June, 2017, had considered a report detailing the Appointment of Proper Officers (minute 7 refers) and had made two recommendations for consideration by Council.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the following recommendations of the Executive Board be adopted:-

“10.1 that the Authority appoints the following named consultants from the Health Authority as Proper Officers for the purposes of Health Protection Legislation:-

Mrs Heather Lewis	Consultant in Health Protection
Mr Sion Lingard	Consultant in Health Protection
Dr Christopher Johnson	Consultant in Health Protection
Dr Rhianwen Stiff	Consultant in Communicable Disease Control
Dr Brendan Mason	Consultant in Communicable Disease Control
Dr Gwen Lowe	Consultant in Communicable Disease Control
Dr Graham Brown	Consultant in Communicable Disease Control
Dr Meirion Evans	Consultant Epidemiologist
Dr Christopher Williams	Consultant Epidemiologist
Dr Giri Shakar	Professional Lead Consultation for

10.2 That the appointments take immediate effect and continue until:

- the Council revokes the appointment; or
- the officer provided the Council with 3 months written notice of resignation; or
- the officer ceased employment with the Health Authority.

20. EXECUTIVE BOARD - 2ND MAY, 2017

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the report of the above meeting be received.

11.2. EXECUTIVE BOARD - 26TH JUNE, 2017

[NOTE: Councillors S.L. Davies and J.D. James had earlier declared an interest in this item.]

Reference was made to minute 8 and the fact that at the meeting the Executive Board Member outlined two possible solutions to the high school based EVR and redundancy costs i.e. redeployment of staff and that schools may have to face some of these costs themselves in the future and it was felt that details of these possible solutions should have been included in the minutes.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the report of the above meeting be received.

CHAIR

DATE