

WEDNESDAY, 12 OCTOBER 2022

**TO: MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS
PANEL**

I HEREBY SUMMON YOU TO ATTEND A **VIRTUAL MEETING OF THE MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL** WHICH WILL BE HELD AT **10.00 AM, ON WEDNESDAY, 19TH OCTOBER, 2022** FOR THE TRANSACTION OF THE BUSINESS OUTLINED ON THE ATTACHED AGENDA

Wendy Walters

CHIEF EXECUTIVE



PLEASE RECYCLE

Democratic Officer:	Janine Owen
Telephone (direct line):	01267 224030
E-Mail:	JanineOwen@carmarthenshire.gov.uk

Wendy Walters Prif Weithredwr, *Chief Executive*,
Neuadd y Sir, Caerfyrddin. SA31 1JP
County Hall, Carmarthen. SA31 1JP

**MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT
APPEALS PANEL**

3 OR 4 MEMBERS

CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT, WASTE AND INFRASTRUCTURE

1. Councillor **E.G. Thomas**

CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & WELSH LANGUAGE

1. Councillor **G. Davies**

LOCAL MEMBERS FOR THE APPELLANT LEARNER'S WARD

1. Councillor **T. Evans**
2. Councillor **M. James**

NOTE:-

1. THE CHAIR OF THE MEMBERS APPEAL PANEL SHALL BE THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT, WASTE AND INFRASTRUCTURE (OR IN HIS OR HER ABSENCE THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION AND WELSH LANGUAGE)
2. NO SUBSTITUTES ARE ALLOWED AT MEETINGS OF THE PANEL

AGENDA

1. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
2. **DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST**
3. **MINUTES**
 - 3.1 **17TH AUGUST 2022 - 10:00AM** 5 - 8
 - 3.2 **17TH AUGUST 2022 - 10:10AM** 9 - 10
 - 3.3 **17TH AUGUST 2022 - 10:20AM** 11 - 12
 - 3.4 **17TH AUGUST 2022 - 10:30AM** 13 - 14
 - 3.5 **17TH AUGUST 2022 - 10:40AM** 15 - 16
 - 3.6 **17TH AUGUST 2022 - 10:50AM** 17 - 18
 - 3.7 **17TH AUGUST 2022 - 11:00AM** 19 - 20
 - 3.8 **17TH AUGUST 2022 - 11:10AM** 21 - 22
4. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

THE REPORT RELATING TO THE FOLLOWING ITEM IS NOT FOR PUBLICATION AS IT CONTAINS EXEMPT INFORMATION AS DEFINED IN PARAGRAPH 12 OF PART 4 OF SCHEDULE 12A TO THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT, 1972 AS AMENDED BY THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) (VARIATION) (WALES) ORDER 2007.

IF FOLLOWING THE APPLICATION OF THE PUBLIC INTEREST TEST THE PANEL RESOLVES PURSUANT TO THE ACT TO CONSIDER THIS ITEM IN PRIVATE, THE PUBLIC WILL BE EXCLUDED FROM THE MEETING DURING SUCH CONSIDERATION.
5. **TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT H.A. AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT** 23 - 42

This page is intentionally left blank

WEDNESDAY, 17 AUGUST 2022

PRESENT (Virtual): Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors (Virtually):

G. Davies	D. Price	A. Vaughan Owen	
-----------	----------	-----------------	--

Also Present (Virtually):

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

A. John, Assistant Solicitor

E. Anthony, Senior School Admissions Officer

A. Eynon, Principal Translator

J. Owens, Democratic Services Officer

K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer

Virtual Meeting - 10.00 - 10.08 am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. MINUTES

3.1 6TH JULY 2022 – 10:00AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th July 2022 (10:00a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.2. 6TH JULY 2022 - 10:10AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th July 2022 (10:10a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.3. 6TH JULY 2022 - 10:20AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th April 2022 (10:20a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.4. 6TH JULY 2022 - 10:30AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th July 2022 (10:30a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.5. 6TH JULY 2022 - 10:40AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th July 2022 (10:40a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.6. 6TH JULY 2022 - 10:50AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th July 2022 (10:50a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.7. 6TH JULY 2022 - 11:00AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th July 2022 (11:00a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.8. 6TH JULY 2022 - 11:10AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th July 2022 (11:10a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.9. 6TH JULY 2022 - 11:30AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 6th July 2022 (11:30a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

4. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

5. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT E.M. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 4 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to

the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant E.M. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that E.M. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

This page is intentionally left blank

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL**WEDNESDAY, 17 AUGUST 2022****PRESENT (Virtual):** Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)**Councillors (Virtually):**

G. Davies L.R. Bowen

Also Present (Virtually):

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

A. John, Assistant Solicitor

E. Anthony, Senior School Admissions Officer

A. Eynon, Principal Translator

J. Owens, Democratic Services Officer

K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer (Note Taker)

Virtual Meeting - 10.10 - 10.17 am**1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT G.F.M. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant G.F.M. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that G.F.M. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant D.S. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the appeal submitted by D.S. for free home to school transport be upheld.

CHAIR

DATE

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant G.R. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that G.R. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

WEDNESDAY, 17 AUGUST 2022

PRESENT (Virtual): Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors (Virtually):

G. Davies

Also Present (Virtually):

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

A. John, Assistant Solicitor

E. Anthony, Senior School Admissions Officer

A. Eynon, Principal Translator

J. Owens, Democratic Services Officer

K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer (Note Taker)

Virtual Meeting - 10.40 - 10.44 am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT H.K. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant H.K. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that H.K. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant L.L. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that L.L. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

WEDNESDAY, 17 AUGUST 2022

PRESENT (Virtual): Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors (Virtually):

G. Davies

Also Present (Virtually):

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

A. John, Assistant Solicitor

M. Jacob, Traffic and Road Safety Manager

E. Anthony, Senior School Admissions Officer

A. Eynon, Principal Translator

J. Owens, Democratic Services Officer

K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer (Note Taker)

Virtual Meeting - 11.05 - 11.09 am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

An apology for absence was received from Councillor G. Jones.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT L.M. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant L.M. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking distance and therefor, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the observations of the departmental officers, together with the individual circumstances of the case and the assessment of the potential walking route from L.M's home address to the designated school.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the appeal be refused on the basis that L.M's home address was located within the statutory walking distance of the designated Local Education Authority School and that the walking route had been assessed as being suitable in accordance with Welsh Government Criteria.

CHAIR

DATE

WEDNESDAY, 17 AUGUST 2022

PRESENT (Virtual): Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors (Virtually):

G. Davies

Also Present (Virtually):

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

A. John, Assistant Solicitor

E. Anthony, Senior School Admissions Officer

A. Eynon, Principal Translator

J. Owens, Democratic Services Officer

K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer (note taker)

Virtual Meeting - 11.18 - 11.22 am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT T.S. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant T.S. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that T.S. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

Agenda Item 5

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank