

Document Pack



sirgar.llyw.cymru
carmarthenshire.gov.wales

THURSDAY, 24 OCTOBER 2024

**TO: MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS
PANEL**

I HEREBY SUMMON YOU TO ATTEND A **VIRTUAL MEETING OF THE MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL** WHICH WILL BE HELD **AT 10.00 AM ON WEDNESDAY, 6TH NOVEMBER, 2024** FOR THE TRANSACTION OF THE BUSINESS OUTLINED ON THE ATTACHED AGENDA

Wendy Walters

CHIEF EXECUTIVE

Democratic Officer:	Kevin Thomas
Telephone (direct line):	01267 224027
E-Mail:	kjthomas@carmarthenshire.gov.uk

Wendy Walters Prif Weithredwr, *Chief Executive*,
Neuadd y Sir, Caerfyrddin. SA31 1JP
County Hall, Carmarthen. SA31 1JP

**MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT
APPEALS PANEL**

3 OR 4 MEMBERS

CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT, WASTE AND INFRASTRUCTURE

1. Councillor **E.G. Thomas**

CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & WELSH LANGUAGE

1. Councillor **G. Davies**

LOCAL MEMBER(S) FOR THE APPELLANT LEARNER'S WARD

1. Councillor **S. Davies**
2. Councillor **J. Hart**

NOTE:-

1. THE CHAIR OF THE MEMBERS APPEAL PANEL SHALL BE THE CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT, WASTE AND INFRASTRUCTURE (OR IN HIS OR HER ABSENCE THE CABINET MEMBER FOR EDUCATION AND WELSH LANGUAGE)
2. NO SUBSTITUTES ARE ALLOWED AT MEETINGS OF THE PANEL

AGENDA

1. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE.**
2. **DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST**
3. **MINUTES**
 - 3.1 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 10.00AM** 5 - 6
 - 3.2 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 10.10AM** 7 - 8
 - 3.3 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 10.20AM** 9 - 10
 - 3.4 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 10.30AM** 11 - 12
 - 3.5 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 10.40AM** 13 - 14
 - 3.6 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 10.50AM** 15 - 16
 - 3.7 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 11.00AM** 17 - 18
 - 3.8 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 11.10AM** 19 - 20
 - 3.9 **8TH OCTOBER 2024 - 11.20AM** 21 - 22
4. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

THE REPORT RELATING TO THE FOLLOWING ITEM IS NOT FOR PUBLICATION AS IT CONTAINS EXEMPT INFORMATION AS DEFINED IN PARAGRAPH 12 OF PART 4 OF SCHEDULE 12A TO THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT, 1972 AS AMENDED BY THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) (VARIATION) (WALES) ORDER 2007.

IF FOLLOWING THE APPLICATION OF THE PUBLIC INTEREST TEST THE PANEL RESOLVES PURSUANT TO THE ACT TO CONSIDER THIS ITEM IN PRIVATE, THE PUBLIC WILL BE EXCLUDED FROM THE MEETING DURING SUCH CONSIDERATION.
5. **TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT GSA AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT** 23 - 44

This page is intentionally left blank

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

TUESDAY, 8 OCTOBER 2024

PRESENT: Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies

Also Present:

T. Pilarz, Assistant Solicitor

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

K. Phillips, LINC Project Manager

E. Anthony, Senior School Admissions Officer

K. Evans, Democratic Services Officer

A. Eynon, Simultaneous Translator

Virtual Meeting 10:00am – 10.06am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. MINUTES

3.1. 12 SEPTEMBER 2024 - 10.30AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held at 10:30a.m on the 12 September, 2024 be signed as a correct record.

3.2. 12 SEPTEMBER, 2024 - 10.40AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held at 10:40a.m on the 12 September, 2024 be signed as a correct record.

3.3. 12 SEPTEMBER, 2024 - 10.50AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held at 10:50a.m on the 12 September, 2024 be signed as a correct record.

3.4. 12 SEPTEMBER, 2024 - 11.00AM

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held at 11:00a.m on the 21st August, 2024 be signed as a correct record.

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

4. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

5. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT AKRJ AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 4 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant AKRJ free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED that the appeal submitted by AKRJ for free Home to School Transport be upheld.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

TUESDAY, 8 OCTOBER 2024

PRESENT: Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors :

G. Davies

T.M. Higgins

Also Present:

T. Pilarz, Assistant Solicitor

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

K. Phillips, LINC Project Manager

E. Anthony, Senior School Admissions Officer

K. Evans, Democratic Services Officer

A. Eynon, Simultaneous Translator

Virtual Meeting - 10.10am - 10.25am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT CJ AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant C.J. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance. The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that C.J. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

TUESDAY, 8 OCTOBER 2024

PRESENT: Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies

H.A.L. Evans

J.K. Howell

Also Present:

T. Pilarz, Assistant Solicitor

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

K. Phillips, LINC Project Manager

E. Anthony, Senior School Admissions Officer

K. Evans, Democratic Services Officer

A. Eynon, Simultaneous Translator

Virtual Meeting - 10.25am - 10.36 am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT EE & AE AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant E.E & A.E. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance. The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that E.E. & A.E. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant G.O. & F.O. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance. The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that G.O & F.O. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

TUESDAY, 8 OCTOBER 2024

PRESENT: Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies

Also Present:

T. Pilarz, Assistant Solicitor

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

K. Phillips, LINC Project Manager

E. Anthony, Senior Schools Administration Officer

K. Evans, Democratic Services Officer

A. Eynon, Simultaneous Translator

Virtual Meeting - 10.50am - 10.52 am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

An apology for absence was received from Councillor P. Warlow and Councillor M. Cranham.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT HRS AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant H.R.S. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the 3mile statutory walking distance from the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED that, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the appeal be refused on the basis that H.R.S.'s home address was located within the statutory walking distance of the designated Local Education Authority School.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

TUESDAY, 8 OCTOBER 2024

PRESENT: Councillor E.G. Thomas (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies

G.R. Jones

Also Present:

T. Pilarz, Assistant Solicitor

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

K. Phillips, LINC Project Manager

E. Anthony, Senior Schools Administration Officer

K. Evans, Democratic Services Officer

A. Eynon, Simultaneous Translator

Virtual Meeting - 10.53am - 11.02 am

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

Councillor	Minute No.	Nature of Interest
G. R. Jones	4 – To consider an appeal by applicant JCT against a decision by officers for the non-provision of free school transport	He had been in a community meeting where child had been discussed. Therefore, declared personal and prejudicial interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following item was not for publication as the report contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT JCT AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

(NOTE: Councillor G.R. Jones had earlier declared an interest in this item but remained in the meeting and did not vote)

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

Following the application of the public interest test it was UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant J.C.T. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the 3mile statutory walking distance from the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED that, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the appeal be refused on the basis that J.C.T.'s home address was located within the statutory walking distance of the designated Local Education Authority School.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant L.B. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that L.B. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant W.B. & G.B. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that W.B. & G.B. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant W.D. & D.D. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED that the appeal submitted by W.D. & D.D. for free Home to School Transport be upheld.

CHAIR

DATE

Note: These minutes are subject to confirmation at the next meeting.

Agenda Item 5

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank