

# COUNTY COUNCIL

WEDNESDAY, 14<sup>TH</sup> NOVEMBER, 2018

**PRESENT:** Councillor J.M. Charles [Chair]

## Councillors:

F. Akhtar	L.R. Bowen	K.V. Broom	C.A. Campbell
D.M. Cundy	S.A. Curry	C.A. Davies	G. Davies
H.L. Davies	I.W. Davies	J.A. Davies	T.A.J. Davies
W.R.A. Davies	K.Davies	E. Dole	J.S. Edmunds
P.M. Edwards	D.C. Evans	H.A.L. Evans	L.D. Evans
R.E. Evans	W.T. Evans	A.L. Fox	S.J.G. Gilasbey
C.J. Harris	T.M. Higgins	J.K. Howell	P. Hughes-Griffiths
P.M. Hughes	A. James	J.D. James	R. James
D.M. Jenkins	J.P. Jenkins	G.H. John	B.W. Jones
C. Jones	D. Jones	G.R. Jones	H.I. Jones
T.J. Jones	A. Lenny	M.J.A. Lewis	K. Lloyd
K. Madge	S. Matthews	A.G. Morgan	E. Morgan
S. Najmi	A.Vaughan Owen	B.D.J. Phillips	J.S. Phillips
D. Price	J.G. Prosser	B.A.L. Roberts	E.M.J.G. Schiavone
A.D.T. Speake	L.M. Stephens	B. Thomas	E.G. Thomas
G. Thomas	G.B. Thomas	J. Tremlett	D.T. Williams
J.E. Williams			

## Also Present:

Mr M. James	-	Chief Executive
Mr C. Moore	-	Director of Corporate Services
Mr J. Morgan	-	Director of Community Services
Mr G. Morgans	-	Director of Education & Children's Services
Mrs R. Mullen	-	Director of Environment
Mrs W. Walters	-	Director of Regeneration & Policy
Ms L. Rees Jones	-	Head of Administration & Law
Mr I. Llewellyn	-	Forward Planning Manager
Mrs M. Evans Thomas	-	Principal Democratic Services Officer

**Chamber, County Hall, Carmarthen : 10.00 a.m. - 12.45 p.m.**

## 1. APOLOGIES AND OTHER MATTERS

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors S.M. Allen, S.L. Davies, D. Harries, A.S.J. McPherson, D. Nicholas, H.B. Shepardson, D. Thomas and D.E. Williams.

The Chair welcomed Councillor Hazel Evans back to the Chamber and wished her well following her recent surgery.

The Chair welcomed Zac Hayman from the Melbourne Welsh Church in Australia, who was accompanied by the Reverend Beti-Wyn James and who had come along to observe the meeting.

## 2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTERESTS

<b>Councillor</b>	<b>Minute Number</b>	<b>Nature of Interest</b>
K. Broom	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens a smallholding. Granted dispensation to speak by the Monitoring Officer on 13 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
C.A. Campbell	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land but does not get any assistance. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
J.M. Charles	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
C.A. Davies	7.1 – Notice of Motion	We are farmers. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
J.A. Davies	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land. Granted dispensation to speak by the Monitoring Officer on 13 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
T.A.J. Davies	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
E. Dole	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land but does not get any assistance from anywhere.
H.A.L. Evans	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Her brother-in-law owns land. Granted dispensation by the Monitoring Officer on 14 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
L.D. Evans	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Her daughter and son-in-law farm.
W.T. Evans	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land but does not receive assistance from the County Council, the Welsh Government, the English Government or Europe Union. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
K. Howell	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
A. James	7.1 – Notice of Motion	He is a farmer and he owns land. Granted dispensation to speak by the Monitoring Officer on 13 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
A. Lenny	7.1 – Notice of Motion	A relative owns land. Granted dispensation to speak by the Monitoring Officer on 13 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
M.J.A. Lewis	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
E. Schiavone	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land but does not get assistance.
L.M. Stephens	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owens land but does not get any assistance from anywhere.

G.B. Thomas	7.1 – Notice of Motion	He is a full-time farmer. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.
A. Vaughan Owen	7.1 – Notice of Motion	A close family member has land.
J.E. Williams	7.1 – Notice of Motion	Owns land. Granted dispensation to speak by the Standards Committee on 12 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018.

### 3. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

- The Chair attended a number of remembrance events including services in Carmarthen, Llanelli and Five Roads. He had the honour of attending the unveiling ceremony of a new memorial by Llanarthne Church gate for he parishioners from Llanarthne who were lost during the war. He also attended the unveiling of a memorial in Llansteffan Hall for the last of the soldiers from the area who lost their lives in the First World War and he opened a memorial garden in Dafen. He opened an excellent educational exhibition in Whitland and witnessed an unique performance of “Oh what a lovely war” in Llanelli and memorial concerts in Garnant and Burry Port. He thanks all the organisers and in particular the British Legion. All the events he attended were memorable and an emotional experience which made everyone realise the horrors of war;
- The Chair referred to the poppy pictures which were illuminated on the wall of County Hall on the evening of Sunday, 11<sup>th</sup> November. Illuminations have also been shown on County hall for Baby Loss Awareness Week, World Polio Day and will be shown for World Aids Day;
- The Chair referred to the severe weather endured in Carmarthenshire last month. Our thoughts are with the individuals, businesses and communities who suffered as a result of the worst flooding we have seen for over 30 years. The Leader of Council provided an update on the flooding and informed Council that the day after the flooding, when the river rose to unprecedented levels, a fund was set up to assist those affected by the floods. Officers visited those area affected to offer practical help and also assistance in accessing the Fund. The Leader expressed his heartfelt gratitude to the officers involved in the aftermath, who went above and beyond the call of duty. A further Fund was set up a few days later to assist the 210 businesses affected by the floods. Officers also offered help and assistance to get those businesses back up and running as soon as possible. With regard to roads and infrastructure, all roads and bridges have been inspected and have opened apart from the A484 in Cwmdud, which was affected by the landslide. An estimated £3m is needed to ensure that that infrastructure is returned to how it was before the storm. The Leader, on behalf of the Council, extended his sincere condolences to the family and friends of Corey Sharpling, who lost his life in the tragedy in Cwmdud;
- Last November the White Ribbon Campaign was discussed. The Campaign’s vision is for a society free from all forms of men’s violence. Since then Councillor Cefin Campbell has been appointed as an Ambassador for the Campaign. He sought White Ribbon Accreditation by the White Ribbon Day 2018, namely 25<sup>th</sup> November, and the Council

successfully achieved White Ribbon Status in August in recognition of the work we are doing and what we are planning on doing to involve men in speaking out and challenging male violence against women. The Chair encouraged members to sign up online to take the pledge to “Never commit, excuse or remain silent about male violence against women”;

- The Chair extended condolences to Mrs Ann Davies following the death of her husband, Denzil Davies, former Member of Parliament for Llanelli;
- The Chair extended birthday wishes to HRH Prince Charles on his 70<sup>th</sup> birthday.

#### **4. TO APPROVE AND SIGN AS A CORRECT RECORD THE MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL MEETING HELD ON THE 10TH OCTOBER, 2018**

**UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** that the minutes of the meeting of Council held on the 10<sup>th</sup> October, 2018 be signed as a correct record.

#### **5. PUBLIC QUESTIONS**

##### **5.1. QUESTION BY MR N.B. LEWIS TO COUNCILLOR DAVID JENKINS, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR RESOURCES**

“What was the total of council tax collected in Carmarthenshire in the year 2017?”

**Response by Councillor David Jenkins, Executive Board Member for Resources:-**

“I must first clarify that Local Authority financial budgets are based on financial years not calendar years so the financial year runs from 1<sup>st</sup> April of one year to the 31<sup>st</sup> March of the following year. Therefore, I will provide you with the following information – the Council Tax collected in the period 1<sup>st</sup> April, 2016 to 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2017 amounts to £83.96m and the Council Tax collected in the period 1<sup>st</sup> April, 2017 to 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2018 amounts to £88.13m and if you do a rough calculation and you take 3/12 of the first figure and 9/12 of the second figure, a simple maths approach, that will give you an approximate figure for collection for 2017 of £87m.”

**Mr Lewis asked the following supplementary question:-**

“What amount did farmers in Carmarthenshire receive in subsidies from payments made by the Welsh Government or any other sources such as G.A.P.?”

**Response by Councillor David Jenkins, Executive Board Member for Resources:-**

“I’m afraid the answer to that question is not in my gift. That would have to be referred to the Welsh Government in Cardiff. We don’t have that information at county level.”

#### **6. QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS**

##### **6.1. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR GILES MORGAN TO COUNCILLOR GLYNOG DAVIES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

“Last year we set up a school development fund of £500k. Can I ask the member for education how much of the School Improvement Fund has been taken up, and how many applications have been made? When this was introduced my expectation was that this would be some relief for schools that were trying their best but not able to make ends meet and who were sliding into more deficit budgets. The fund has turned into something altogether different where it is not a general pot for schools struggling with budgets but rather a more restricted pot of money to be used for making efficiencies. Can I ask if this was the executive board members intention when the budget was formulated last year?”

**Response by Councillor Glynog Davies, Executive Board Member for Education and Children:-**

“As it was mentioned last year, as part of the process of creating a budget for this year, it was agreed that we set up this specific fund which is the School Improvement Fund and it was a considerable sum to be put into this pot which was £0.5m, which is a lot of money. But it’s money that can be given once only, it was explained it was a one-time fund that would be available for 2018/19.

The intention was to put it in a similar way to the general development fund, that fund is still in existence of course. If you look to the minutes of the Council back in February this year, you can see that the aim of this specific fund was to support schools further and as a Council, myself as the Member I do my very best to support schools. The Department works very hard to support schools. But more importantly here, giving direct access to schools to this specific fund which is an investment fund to save. That was explained fully at the time, that it is a fund to invest to save it was. This was a special fund to invest to save, that was the intention of the fund. To enable schools to have something upfront in order to make efficiencies at the school, that is what I explained at the time. The rationale was clear, the explanation in my opinion was very clear. I wanted to support schools in their efforts to make efficiencies their efforts to achieve sustainable savings that is what the intention was. It did take a little time to finalise the grant criteria and the conditions, but it is now operational. I can assure you, to date, we have received 8 applications to the value of £185k, 3 have already been agreed a total of £116k. The other 5 applications that were only recently received are being currently reviewed. It is worth noting that all applications are primarily to support the upgrading of IT and communication systems within our schools and these then would have a clear effect on making those schools more sustainable in the future.”

**6.2. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR GILES MORGAN TO COUNCILLOR GLYNOG DAVIES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

“Can I ask the member for education whether he will spearhead changes to the ALN funding pot at the next budget round. Currently some schools who try their best to integrate challenging pupils into mainstream education are penalised by the way we spread out the ALN pot. Can I seek assurances that this will be looked during the current budget process?”

## **Response by Councillor Glynog Davies, Executive Board Member for Education and Children:-**

“The first thing I would like to say is that I do discuss the Additional Learning Needs budget on a regular basis. The Director is here this morning and he is witness that we discuss this situation on a regular basis, myself, him and also the Heads of Service, we have meetings on a monthly basis. You should also remember that I am Chair on a Governing Board and I know as well as any of you about the challenges that schools are facing. The pressure that is on schools on a daily basis in order to ensure that they do support these children who do have additional learning needs and there are learners like these in our schools.

I do have to say this, as a County we have been a little bit innovative in a way, maybe you didn't realised this, but we were amongst the first to go ahead with schemes. I think about 4 years ago, we went to use some of the funding for additional learning needs, specifically give that to the schools to sort out and assess their own needs. By now of course other Counties are doing this. It is important that schools have a personal hold on this money and use it in a way that is appropriate to them, suitable for their children.

21m went to the schools last year to support these learners, almost 600k more than was given the year before. The schools by now receive 76% of the total which is spent compared with the Welsh average of 73%. Schools are therefore, able to plan locally to meet their own needs. As you know the system is being changed now and I next week will be Chairing a very important meeting in Cardiff next week to discuss these changes. What we are doing prepares the way to develop these local matters to meet the needs of our pupils. We listen to the schools and we try and review the situation according to the answers that we receive from the schools.

Every element of the school funding formula is reviewed continuously, it is important to listen and that feedback does reach us, because I do realise that in many locations that can be very complicated and very difficult to try and meet these needs.

That following the feedback about the challenges that certain inclusive schools experience, we have, over the last few months been looking at the formula for allocating our ALN funding to ensure that it better reflects the needs of our schools. We are currently looking at it once again. We are working on models based on a number of funding proposals in order to identify the one that will best support the practices within our schools. However, any change to the formula will affect schools differently. There will be some losers, but there will be some winners. The pot is a finite pot, it is not a bottomless pit, unfortunately it is a finite pot and it is under extreme pressure. This new formula proposal will be shared with members of our School Budget Forum prior to consultation with all schools. There will be consultation with all schools for us to implement this in the next financial year.”

## **Councillor Giles Morgan asked the following supplementary question:-**

“Just to say thank you for that comprehensive reply and I am glad that it is going to be looked at. In fairness I have had meetings with Gareth along with the

Headmaster and they know that it has also gone to the Secondary Heads Forum as well where concern was expressed at how the pot is divided up currently.

People might not know about school action plus and it does get a bit complicated when you look into it. I am glad it is being looked at and as far as I am concerned money needs to follow the pupil in the best way that it can. I will take those assurances that things are being looked at and look forward to speaking to you in the future.”

### **6.3. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

“Could the Leader of Council please give a brief overview on the process that was undertaken in choosing a private sector partner for the Wellness Village, outlining how many organisations took part in the Competitive Dialogue process and the reason Sterling Health was chosen?”

#### **Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“Some Members of this Council if they wish can leave at this point if they want and go to the lounge outside and read what is going to be discussed in the local paper if you would like before it’ will be discussed because it appears that the Leader of the opposition has shared these questions beforehand with a journalist that is what Richard Jewell has said. I’m stated that for two reasons because one of the last paragraphs it says I did have a request from this journalist to answer these questions to him before this council meeting and I rejected that and I’m not sure how he can say that Mr Dole added because I did not speak to him. I refused to speak to him through the department downstairs. I reminded him that the democratic seats in the context of local authority and the answers to the questions, not in a journalism’s office but here. This is where they need to be answered and the fact that it is outlined here in a local paper before we have had the question asked formally here and before the answer has been set formally shows a lack of respect to this chamber and to democratic processes in this county. This isn’t how it works. This is where questions are asked. I had to remind the journalist that he should turn up at the meeting and then report on what has been discussed, not the other way around, Just to mention that before we start.

For clarification the tender process was followed in order to identify a development partner, not a private sector partner. Perhaps I can explain the different stages in that process, as has been asked for. Firstly, the procurement scope and process itself. A prior information notice and a market sounding questionnaire were placed on the 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2017, closed on the 10<sup>th</sup> April, 2017 last year. That aim was in order to generate interest in the procurement. A Notice was then placed in the official Journal of the European Union and a tender was issued inviting bids from organisations or consortia to partner the authority as development partners. That stage closed last summer on the 8<sup>th</sup> August, 2017. Bidders were asked to submit a pre-qualification questionnaire for assessment. In total 34 organisations viewed the PQQ and one bidder submitted the questionnaire. Following assessment, that one bid was deemed to be compliant and was asked to participate in the next part of the process which was the dialogue sessions. So, then we were into the competitive dialogue stage of the process. Two rounds of dialogue were undertaken. Each comprising of six individual meetings. Following each round of

dialogue, a series of workshops were then held with the bidder to consider the details around the proposals. The dialogue sessions and the workshops consisted of key senior officers across relevant Carmarthenshire County Council Departments such as leisure, social services, legal, finance, procurement, regeneration, property along with representation from our key partners in the health and further education sectors. The procurement process then concluded with the collaboration agreement which was signed between Carmarthenshire County Council, Swansea University and Stirling Health Security Holdings Ltd. So, in a nutshell, that's how we concluded the process, and that's how Stirling Health Security Holdings Ltd were chosen."

**Councillor James asked the following supplementary question:-**

"In 2016 your Executive Board entered a twelve month exclusivity agreement with Kent Neurosciences Ltd to develop the idea of the village. Are you not concerned, as Stirling Health have virtually the same Directors as Kent Neurosciences had that the process does not appear to fair nor open?"

**Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

"Can I just say that added to your disrespect to the Chamber, you disrespected the Chair. He is the Chair of the meeting and he will decide and he will decide how he addresses himself, not yourself nor me. I would refer to my previous answer, you asked me to outline the process. I've outlined the process for you. I've made that clear as to how we got to where we are now. That clarity is there for all to see. It would also have been clear if you had attended the Exec Board where we discussed that. You chose not to be here then but that was discussed fully. You would have had it without having to come back to ask this question of full council. The answer remains the same. I'm just wondering why you would presumably try to undermine that process if that's what your aim is because I've made it very clear about what this brings to the people of Llanelli. I'll looking in a minute at the members behind you with gold fished mouths wondering why you chose to attack what we intend to do on Delta Lakes and this village. It's as you know, well you would know if you'd have come to that meeting. It features a community Health Hub, which is made up of an institute of life science, a well-ness education centre, a clinical delivery centre, assisted living accommodation, that includes extra care housing, a nursing home. It also boosts independent living through the use of supported living technologies developed on site in Delta Lakes. It includes a wellness hotel, to meet demand for wellness tourism in among the other developments planned for the village along with landscape spaces for walking and cycling for Llanelli residents and residents of Carmarthenshire. Children's play area and spaces for outdoor performing arts. The wellness hub and community health elements of the village are anticipated to be operational in 2021 with the overall completion earmarked for 2023, creating close to 2,000 high quality jobs in the next fifteen years. The wellness and life science village is projected to give the local economy a £467m boost. An outline planning application for the development will be considered for approval in the coming months with construction due to commence in 2019. The collaboration as I've said with education providers across the Swansea Bay City Region will focus on training opportunities for all level of employment in the village development leaving a long term legacy for local people. Adequate car parking will be provided on site along with bicycle stands a drop off zone for buses, taxis and school visits linking with the Millenium Coastal Path and



areas of the village to be landscaped for recreation. That will further boost our thriving tourism industry. What part of that don't you like?"

#### **6.4. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF COUNCIL**

"Could the Leader of Council highlight who the Directors are behind the Joint Venture Partner and what experience they bring to the project?"

##### **Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

"The Directors of the Joint Venture Companies to deliver the village are yet to be confirmed. Legal advice has been sought on the most beneficial corporate structure and shareholder agreement for the Authority to enter into."

##### **Councillor James asked the following supplementary question:-**

"In a press release earlier this year it stated that the company was chosen as they were experts in the field. Now, as of September 2018 cardiologist Dr Holt Vickman has resigned from Stirling Health whilst the former council leader of this authority Meryl Gravell remains a director of this company. Could you please indicate whether Miss or Doctor Holt Vickman is still involved with the project and what involvement former council leader has in this project?"

##### **Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

"Procurement Stirling Health were partnered with leading architects, construction, pharmaceutical and medical advice device companies who have a global reputation. They are associated with a number of medical consultants in particular with world leading expertise in rehabilitation, neurology and cardiology as well. The names of the current directors of Stirling Health Security Holdings Ltd are Franz Dickman, James Dickman Rupert Harrison and Kevin Schmidt."

#### **6.5. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

"The Collaboration Agreement for the projects on Delta Lakes with Swansea University and Sterling Health is said to cost £200 million, please could the Leader of Council detail how each partner will be expected to contribute to this cost?"

##### **Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

"The simple answer is that financial contributions will be made by each partner with prudence. That's the simple answer. I guess what he might be looking for, and I'll try to clarify, it's just to give you the following figures, but again, they are known, and I'm sharing anything you would not know and you wouldn't have known if you had not come to that meeting. So, to clarify, the following figures relate to investment rather than cost and I would make that difference, it is an investment not a cost. The City Deal itself will contribute £40m, Carmarthenshire County Council will contribute £32m, including leisure centre and land value, and the private sector financing comes in at £127.5m. It's important to add that there's significant interest from major financial institutions. However, the funding cannot

be secured until the investor ready business plans and designs for the individual elements, not including the wellness hub and community health hub are complete and presented to these organisations. That's being undertaken presently. It hardly needs stating that due diligence with the investors will be done once negotiations have advanced further and the funding secured with the appropriate investor."

**Councillor James asked the following supplementary question:-**

"According to financial statement of Stirling Health in 2017 the company has net liabilities of £127k and are relying on loans from the Directors to continue trading. How does this Council expect to make a financial contribution to the £127m you project?"

**Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

"The following legal advice had been obtained in respect of the corporate structure that is to be developed with partners in order to deliver the village. The stakeholders have been advised to establish new corporate vehicles for the project in the form of companies limited by shares, again this was shared in the Executive Board meeting. These special purpose vehicles will enable that £200m to proceed with private public finance and will protect this Councils investment. A corporate structure allows project risks and security for financial projects to be placed at the project company level rather than directly with the Council, it is a clean slate start. A corporate structure will incorporate a business plan, a risk register, policies designed to protect the Council and ensure appropriate and robust accountability and recognition of Local Authority governance requirements."

**6.6. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

"Could the Leader of Council outline how much this Authority has paid in consultancy fees since May 2015, including those connected with projects relating to the Swansea Bay City Deal?"

**Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

"The task of asking Officers to calculate how much this Authority has been paid in consultancy fees over a 3 and a half year period is enormous. All of which would take 3 or 4 officers the best part of a week or more to get to grips with. I note from your question that you also mention projects connected with the Swansea Bay City Deal. Well, in order to provide a comprehensive reply to this aspect of your question I would have to be reliant on the 3 other Authorities who are part of that deal with us to provide us with the information that they have to say nothing of the Welsh Government information around those consultations as well.

I am starting to wonder, do you really want this wellness village to happen and what exactly is the problem here? You will know because of your association with a paper that we have already spoken about and that we announced last week that the one which is to be completed by 2021, will include an aquatic centre featuring a 5m long swimming pool, splash pool, learner pool, a state of the art gym and fitness studios, a multi-purpose sports hall for a range of sports including

badminton and netball, hydrotherapy pool, a clip and climb wall and all of that, you seem to not to want for the residents of Llanelli.”

**Councillor James asked the following supplementary question:-**

“It seems that this administration does not seem to like scrutiny. There are so many questions left unanswered about how you get the money, who’s involved and the public are crying out for this information and all you do is say “don’t worry about it, it will be fine on the night”. Despite austerity this Authority has put millions of pounds into private consultancy firms in order to direct the travel of a leaderless Plaid Cymru administration in Carmarthenshire. Will you today, take advice from the Labour Party pledge to ban the use of consultancy please in Carmarthenshire?”

**Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“No.”

**6.7. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

“Earlier this year, the governance and management structures of Cwm Environmental Limited, were changed to a Teckal company. Could the Leader of Council please indicate what impact, if any, these changes have had on pay and conditions of the employees?”

**Response by Councillor E. Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“I can ensure Councillor James that there were no changes to any staff pay and conditions in relation to Cwm Environmental Limited being re-designated as a Teckal company.”

**Councillor James asked the following supplementary question:-**

“It has been reported to our group that Union Reps are being blocked access to Cwm Environmental within the Company, stating that they do not recognise Trade Unions, and we are asking why? Do you believe that it is right that the Council own company is blocking Trade Union access and not recognising Trade Unions?”

**Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“Employees who decide to become Trade Union Members and those Members who go on to be elected as Trade Union Officials enjoy particular legal rights that require that an employer not treat them any less favourably because of Trade Union Membership or activities that would not treat a none member. These provisions are found in a Trade Union Labour Relations (Consolidation) Act 1992. Cwm Environmental Services PLC is required to comply with this legislative requirement.”

**6.8. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

“Could the Leader of Council please provide information on the remuneration package attached to the new Operations Director post of Delta Wellbeing Limited?”

**Response by Councillor E. Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“There is no such a post in our Company, but I am pleased to take the opportunity to let Council know that as a result of the creation of the service we now in the process of employing an additional six people in Llanelli, because of the new works secured through the arrangements of our Company. The Company has also secured £2.5m worth of new business, which is a great result in such a short period of time and justifies our decision to create the Company in the first place. I have to say once again that I feel a little surprised that you would want to undermine this positive development for Llanelli, particularly as you are a Member representing a Llanelli ward.”

**Councillor James asked the following supplementary question:-**

“Well, I find it quite extraordinary that you say that there isn’t a post when you have an individual in the community that is running this Authority stating their position online under their CV. So could you please look into that matter?”

**Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“Yes, I should explain again that you’ve named a post in your question, but there is no such post. You named the post as the ‘Director post of Delta Well-being’ and I answered that.”

**6.9. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

“This Authority has established several companies in the last eighteen months that has resulted in reduced oversight for services that ordinarily are carried out by the Council; Councillors and the public being unaware of what is happening in these companies; and public finances in connection with public sector ventures being questioned. Will the Leader of Council, therefore, pledge to halt the continuing outsourcing of services to teckal companies and promise not to create any new companies, including any relating to the City Deal, for the remainder of this term?”

**Response by Councillor E. Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“No.”

**Councillor James asked the following supplementary question:-**

“Yes., it is clear from this exchange that this administration is in over its head and being led on a very dark path. Do you really believe that the public are going to trust you with the public purse going forward?”

**Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“That one is yes. Perhaps I can take a moment to explain to Councillor James what a Teckal Company is? A Teckal Company is a common name for a company which benefits from contracts for works, services or supply from its controlling contracting Authority without having to go through a competitive tendering process. Carmarthenshire County Council like all other Authorities must control all of the shares in the Company and must also exercise the day to day control over its affairs. There is no outsourcing here, I know he loves the word but it is irrelevant. In other words it is exactly the same as the relationship between the Council and one of its internal directories. This can be achieved through that governance structure. The Company also has to be inwardly focused not outwardly. The directive requirement is that at least 80% of the activity of a Teckal Company, that is over 80% of its turnover must be for the benefit of its public sector owner. Any contracts with other public sector bodies or private sector entities will not benefit from the Teckal exemption and the company would have to tender in the ordinary way for such contracts in accordance with any applicable procurement legislation.

It is interesting to note in passing that the approach of setting up companies, including for city deal purposes, received a seal of approval from Carwyn Jones, the First Minister and his likely successor Mark Drakeford, just a few months ago. Now there is some political reality for you. Now here is the thing Rob, the practical and financial reality is that Local Authorities across Wales are having to come up with innovative ideas that are delivering services that people represent rely on day in day out. We have to do that in such a way that we make better use of our limited financial resources and look for new opportunities to create new income. I hardly think that we need reminding, that we are in this position largely because of the priorities set by a tired and inept Welsh Labour Government in Cardiff. I was in Cardiff yesterday listening to a most excellent address by the outgoing Chief Executive of the WLGA who made that exact point very eloquently.

I know it is popular to blame the Welsh Minister Government for our financial woes but when the Chancellor Phillip Hammond indicated that there was extra money coming our way, after the recent budget Mark Drakeford made it abundantly clear that Local Government was not his priority. And despite all of his warm words at WLGA events and conferences that remains the same. He was interviewed only last week by the Western Mail and all he could say was, “if all Local Authorities in Wales were subjected to the same level of cuts facing Councils in England, we would be facing cuts of £65m in Wales”. You are better off than England, that was his reply and that is not good enough. Not a hint of anything extra for Local Government in Wales. The money’s there, but he has other priorities. In the meantime we face the real prospect of further cutbacks in the next financial year.

The NHS were licking their lips at the prospect of a very generous 3.5% increase next year. What does he do? Gives them 7% increase in an effort to play ping pong and trump the West Minister Government in London, meanwhile leaving local Authorities with a -5% deficit in real terms.

You know what Councillor James, we all heard the Tories bleating just recently with some hollow words about the supposed end of austerity. We mustn’t allow ourselves to take much comfort in that. Mark Drakeford and the Welsh Government are running their own Welsh austerity programme and we are at the sharp end. This week we start the consultation process on next year’s budget. Let

me remind you of something that you said at our last Council meeting and I quote you said that you would be going to take a forensic look at next year's budget. I'll tell you what you will be far better off doing, taking your forensic look at the woeful provisional budget settlement for Local Governments set in the Labour Government in the Assembly and spending your time rather persuading your Labour colleagues in Cardiff to look again at providing reasonable budget settlement for Local Government. The money's there, and while you are at it remind them about their promise that they told us that we are first in the queue and that we will be prioritised.

I don't know who said it, but there were probably right, knowledge is giving the right answer to a question. If that is true then surely intelligence has to be about the ability to ask the right question in the first place."

#### **6.10. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR EDWARD THOMAS TO COUNCILLOR JANE TREMLETT, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR SOCIAL CARE & HEALTH**

"I recently attended a meeting with you to discuss the possibility of Llandeilo becoming a Dementia Friendly Town. I wonder if you could update myself and my fellow members on the prospect of Carmarthenshire becoming a Dementia Friendly County."

#### **Response by Councillor J. Tremlett, Executive Board Member for Social Care and Health:-**

"Creating Carmarthenshire as a Dementia Friendly County is high on the strategic agenda with work already happening in Llanelli, Ammanford, Llandovery and more recently Laugharne, St Clears, Whitland and the surrounding areas. The latter being the largest rural area to be working towards becoming a dementia friendly community in Wales. Establishing a local structure is the key to the success and sustainability of creating a dementia friendly community and a Local Dementia Action Alliance or similar group is the recommended model to enable you to bring together individuals, organisations and local businesses with shared aims to help the community to be more dementia friendly.

The Local Dementia Action Alliance Group is a collection of stakeholders brought together to help improve the lives of people with Dementia in their area. They usually include the County Councillors, Town and Community Councillors, Police, Ambulance, Fire Service, GP's, Businesses, Local Authorities, community groups, Health Board and members of the public to name a few. This is the model that has been adopted when a Local Authority representative has linked with an area to become dementia friendly.

In conjunction with the Dementia Action Plan for Wales 2018-2022, the locality authority is committed to creating dementia friendly Carmarthenshire. In order to do so, we require staffing resource to support the initiative and have recently secured Welsh Government funding to employ dementia specialist staff. These include dementia key workers in each locality and dementia community resilience staff again in each locality. This will enable us to support more communities to achieve the goal. It is important to note that you are never actually really become a dementia friendly community, but you are always working towards becoming a

dementia friendly community, as specified within the criteria for registration with the Alzheimer's Society. This is to ensure that communities themselves remain committed to the programme. The Laugharne, St Clears, Whitland and surrounding areas are holding their launch on the 1<sup>st</sup> February 2019. The work has been going on for the last year, but the launch evidences that work formally by the Alzheimer's Society. It is the intention on that evening of the launch that they pass the baton to Carmarthen Town and to Llandeilo Town.

In conclusion, we are already working towards becoming a dementia friendly Carmarthenshire, but need to do this correctly in order to obtain recognition from the Alzheimer's Society by following the seven criteria laid out in the foundation criteria for dementia friendly communities recognition processes.”

## **6.11 URGENT QUESTION SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR DERYK CUNDY TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL**

The Chair advised that Councillor Cundy had submitted an urgent question under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 11.4(b) which the Chair had allowed:-

“The proposed closure of Schaefflers with the loss of 220 good jobs is a body blow for Bynea, Llanelli and Carmarthenshire. What is the County Council prepared to do to try and reverse this decision of the company to leave and in the event of being unable to affect that decision, what will they do to support the current employees and their families through this difficult time and in the future?”

### **Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-**

“I fully understand your concern as the Local Member for Dafen. The closure of the plant could mean the loss of over 200 jobs and news of the closure came as a shock to us all. Officers of the Council contacted senior representatives of the company as soon as the news was released on Monday of last week to see what could be done to save these high quality jobs and that is ongoing. I have also written to Mr Greig Littlefair, the Managing Director of Shaeffler UK, asking for an urgent meeting to discuss the future of the Llanelli plant. Shaeffler is a multi-national company which supplies automotive and industrial parts all over the world and moved to Llanelli in 1957. The company has indicated that the Llanelli plant and the one in Plymouth will close within the next two years, with production being relocate to other plants in the US, China, South Korea and Germany. There was also some suggestion also that their decision was partly due to that uncertainty surrounding Brexit. I should also add that I have issued a press release to share our concern about that threat to the 200 jobs following that announcement by Shaeffler in Llanelli to say that we will be working with the Welsh Government and talking to the company in an effort to do all we can to persuade them that Llanelli remains a great place for them to do business with the engineering base that we have and all that that offers. However, we must do more and I do ask the Welsh Government to work with us to quickly approve and release the £40m City Deal funding for Delta |Lakes, the innovative and unique development we've spoken about is gaining international recognition, attracting many large companies to look to invest in the area. We have to capitalise on that interest as quickly as we can to start to provide the 1,800 first class jobs that the Life Science Village with its associated university, health research, teaching, leisure and car facilities will provide. We are also still waiting for the release of the £5m funding for Yr Egin in

Carmarthen which is actually built and open. We need to get these funds released to enable further job creation during this challenging period and we need to provide confidence to the business community at this time to show that our funds are ready to enable them to invest also.”

## 7. TO CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING NOTICE OF MOTION

### 7.1. NOTICE OF MOTION SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR CEFIN CAMPBELL

[NOTE: Councillors Kim Broom, Cefin Campbell, Mansel Charles, Ann Davies, Arwel Davies, Joseph Davies, Emlyn Dole, Hazel Evans, Linda Evans, Tyssul Evans, Ken Howell, Andrew James, Alun Lenny, Jean Lewis, Emlyn Schiavone, Mair Stephens, Gareth Thomas, A. Vaughan Owen and Eirwyn Williams had earlier declared an interest in this item. They remained in the meeting for the debate but left prior to the vote being taken. The Vice-Chair presided over the meeting in the absence of the Chair.]

Council considered the following Notice of Motion submitted by Councillor Cefin Campbell:-

“This Council notes:

- The Welsh Government’s *Brexit and Our Land* White Paper;
- The proposals within the paper to scrap Basic Payments for farmers;
- That basic payments contribute about 80% to farmers’ net profits;
- That the agriculture industry continues to be a substantial employer in Carmarthenshire and that many SMEs across the county are largely dependent on the sector;
- That the Welsh Government’s proposals could lead to other landowners, (e.g. third sector organisations, forestry companies, extremely wealthy individuals or organisations) being able to compete for the public funds currently available to farmers.

This Council expresses concern that the *Brexit and Our Land* consultation paper provides no modelling or assessments of how the proposed changes will impact on the local or national economy.

This Council is concerned that the proposed changes could have a negative impact on Carmarthenshire’s countryside and threaten the future of family farms who have supported the economy, community life and the Welsh language in our rural communities for generations.

This Council believes that no changes to farm payments should be introduced until a thorough and detailed assessment is provided on the potential impact on jobs and the economy in Carmarthenshire and other parts of Wales and that any transition should take place over a long period of time.

In addition to the above the Council also believes that it would make sense for the Welsh Government to delay any decision on basic payments for farmers until after



a trade deal is agreed between the UK and the European Union in relation to Brexit.”

The Motion was duly seconded.

The proposer and seconder of the Motion were afforded the opportunity of speaking in support thereof and proceeded to outline the reasons for its submission, as set out in the Motion

A number of statements were made in support of the Motion. Following a requisition by more than 10 members, in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 16.4, a recorded vote was taken with the votes casts being as follows:-

For the Motion (37)

Councillors F. Akhtar, L. Bowen, D.M. Cundy, S. Curry, G. Davies, H. Davies, I.W. Davies, K. Davies, W.R.A. Davies, J.S. Edmunds, P. Edwards, A. Fox, J. Gilasbey, C. Harris, T. Higgins, P. Hughes-Griffiths, P.M. Hughes, J.D. James, R. James, D.M. Jenkins, G. John, A.C. Jones, B.W. Jones, D. Jones, G. Jones, K. Madge, S. Matthews, A.G. Morgan, E. Morgan, S. Najmi, D. Phillips, D. Price, A.D.T. Speake, E.G. Thomas, G. Thomas, J. Tremlett and D. Williams.

Against the Motion (0)

Abstentions (3)

Councillors K. Lloyd, J. Prosser and B. Thomas.

**RESOLVED that the Notice of Motion be adopted.**

**8. TO CONSIDER RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD**

**8.1. REVISED CARMARTHENSHIRE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN 2018-2033.**

Council was informed that the Executive Board, at its meeting held on the 22<sup>nd</sup> October, 2018 (minute 12 refers) considered the Revised Carmarthenshire Local Development Plan 2018-2033 – Draft Preferred Strategy and made two recommendations, as detailed in the report of the Forward Planning manager, for consideration by Council.

**UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the following recommendations of the Executive Board be accepted:-**

**“That the content of the Draft Preferred Strategy (and supporting documents) for the Revised Local Development Plan 2018-2033 for formal consultation be approved;**

**To grant officers delegated authority to make non-substantive typographical or factual amendments, as necessary, to improve the clarity and accuracy of the Draft Preferred Strategy”.**

**9. TO RECEIVE THE REPORT OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD HELD ON THE 22ND OCTOBER, 2018.**

**UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** that the report of the meeting of the Executive Board held on the 22<sup>nd</sup> October, 2018 be received.

**10. MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES**

**10.1. TO NOTE THAT THE LABOUR GROUP HAS NOMINATED COUNCILLOR JOHN PROSSER TO REPLACE COUNCILLOR ERYL MORGAN ON THE DYFED POWYS POLICE & CRIME PANEL.**

In accordance with Corporate Procedure Rule CPR 2(2)(n) the following nomination from the Labour Group had been received for membership of an outside organisation:-

Councillor John Prosser to replace Councillor Eryl Morgan on the Dyfed Powys Police & Crime Panel.

**UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** to note that Councillor John Prosser is to replace Councillor Eryl Morgan on the Dyfed Powys Police and Crime Panel.

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CHAIR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**DATE**