

**ENVIRONMENTAL & PUBLIC PROTECTION SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**  
**13th January 2020**  
**Efficiency Summary**

	ORIGINAL TARGETS			
	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Chief Executive	492	492	474	1,458
Education & Children	1,029	1,029	991	3,049
Schools Delegated	2,593	2,452	2,501	7,546
Corporate Services	205	205	197	607
Communities	2,814	2,813	2,708	8,335
Environment	1,391	1,391	1,339	4,121
	<b>8,524</b>	<b>8,382</b>	<b>8,210</b>	<b>25,116</b>

	REVISED TARGETS			
	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Chief Executive	492	492	432	1,416
Education & Children	860	1,029	904	2,793
Schools Delegated	-	-	-	0
Corporate Services	205	205	180	590
Communities	2,567	2,813	2,471	7,850
Environment	1,155	1,391	1,222	3,768
	<b>5,279</b>	<b>5,930</b>	<b>5,209</b>	<b>16,418</b>

Proposals					EXISTING POLICY PROPOSALS				NEW POLICY PROPOSALS				TOTAL PROPOSALS											
	MANAGERIAL				2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total								
	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total													2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000													£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Chief Executive	492	451	434	1,377	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	492	451	434	1,377					
Education	385	300	100	785	325	630	0	955	150	0	550	700	860	930	650	2,440								
Schools Delegated	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0					
Corporate Services	205	205	197	607	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	205	205	197	607								
Communities	2,457	2,522	2,267	7,245	75	50	0	125	35	74	69	178	2,567	2,646	2,336	7,549								
Environment	1,015	1,032	927	2,974	109	20	30	159	32	188	25	245	1,155	1,240	982	3,377								
	<b>4,553</b>	<b>4,510</b>	<b>3,925</b>	<b>12,988</b>	<b>509</b>	<b>700</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>1,239</b>	<b>217</b>	<b>262</b>	<b>644</b>	<b>1,123</b>	<b>5,279</b>	<b>5,472</b>	<b>4,599</b>	<b>15,350</b>								

	SHORTFALL - to be identified			
	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	Total
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Chief Executive	0	41	-2	39
Education & Children	0	99	254	353
Schools Delegated	0	0	0	0
Corporate Services	0	0	-17	-17
Communities	0	167	135	302
Environment	0	151	240	391
	<b>0</b>	<b>458</b>	<b>610</b>	<b>1,068</b>

Department	2019-20 Budget	FACT FILE	'2020-21 Proposed	'2021-22 Proposed	'2022-23 Proposed	Total	EFFICIENCY DESCRIPTION
	£'000		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	

**Communities****Public Protection**

Financial Investigator	-136	A financial investigation team has been set up to investigate illegal trading activity across the County, including on-line. Where illegal activity has been proved through the Court system we also implement the Proceeds of Crime legislation (POCA) that means we any profits that are made from this illegal activity are returned to a variety of statutory agencies. Any individual who has lost out can also be re-imbursed.	100	50	50	200	Additional income as a result of pro-active work carried out by our newly created Financial Investigation Unit.
Trading Standards	80	Trading Standards offers a range of services around business and consumer affairs e.g. consumer/business advice and illegal trading.	30	0	0	30	One off reduction in legal fees contingency (Trading Standards)
<b>Total Public Protection</b>			<b>130</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>230</b>	

**Communities Total****130 50 50 230****Environment Department**

Departmental efficiency	departmental budget		10	0	0	10	Review of staff job profiles to ensure they reflect job duties.
-------------------------	---------------------	--	----	---	---	----	---

**Business Support and Performance**

Business Support review	1,696	A further review of the departmental business support function will be undertaken during the next 3 years but this is dependant on system developments to enable more efficient processes.	22	40	0	62	<b>2020/21 &amp; 2021/22</b> : further realignment of the Business support team - all dependant on system developments to enable more efficient processes.
<b>Total Business Support and Performance division</b>			<b>22</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>62</b>	

**Highways & Transport**

Parking Services	-1,162	The County Council provides off street car parking facilities in towns and villages to support the expeditious movement of traffic to enable town centres to function. Parking supports these wider transport policy objectives and enables the authority to maintain highway and public transport services. There are 57 car parks across the county.	167	0	0	167	Increase Parking Charges - Parking charges have been frozen for five years. Maintenance costs and general costs continue to rise. It is proposed to introduce a modest price increase of 20p per charge band to sustain highways and transport services .
Parking Services	as above	-----"	100	0	0	100	Cease gritting of Car Parks - there is no statutory obligation to grit car parks. Given the constraint on resources the Authority will be unable to continue with this service. However, the Authority will continue to grit in surgery car parks
Highways - Public Lighting	1,065	The County Council provides and maintains Street Lighting to help facilitate the safe movement of goods and people. There are over 19,700 columns across the highway network with a further 800 units located on industrial estates and car parks. The street lighting network is currently being modernised via a 3 year investment plan with LED lamps replacing the previous Sodium lamps.	30	0	0	30	Remove Public Lighting Night Patrol - The upgrade of Street Lights to LED lighting reduces the risk of lamp failure. The proposals is to cease the night patrol for checking of street lamps.
Highways - operational	525	The County Council maintains 3,371 km of highway in Carmarthenshire. It is the second largest length of highway network in Wales. The Authority has a statutory duty to maintain the network to a safe standard to facilitate the safe movement of goods and people. Over fifty five percent of the Gross Expenditure relates to supplies and services.	70	0	0	70	Highways - Reduce Mechanical Plant Hire - Savings will be generated from improved plant utilisation and changes to the type and use of plant hired in, reducing costs for service delivery.
Highways - operational	80	-----"	0	10	0	10	Reduce light plant and tool inventory
Highways - Gulley cleansing	400	-----"	0	70	0	70	Rationalise Gulley Cleansing Operation - detailed intelligence on gulley performance has been gathered to enable the service to prioritise the cleansing frequency.
Highways - winter gritting	850	-----"	0	23	23	46	Rationalise Winter Maintenance Operation - routes will be reviewed and reduced to achieve the reduction in expenditure.
Highways - Mechanical road sweeping	254	-----"	93	93	0	186	Cease routine Mechanical Sweeping - the routine highways sweeping function will cease and only be provided on a reactive basis to cover emergency spills affecting the safety of the highway.
Highways - fallen trees	0	-----"	0	15	0	15	Recharge costs for fallen trees on highway - the proposal is to recover costs from landowners for the costs incurred in clearing trees that have fallen on the highway.
Highways - town centre management	19	-----"	0	19	0	19	Reduce Town Centre Management Budget (Minor structural works, paved areas, bollards , street furniture) - Savings delivered through reduction in proactive maintenance work by moving to reactive repairs in town centres.
Highways	365	-----"	0	0	30	30	Reduce General Maintenance Budget - subject to the financial position remaining unchanged the service will be forced to further reduce the level of general maintenance work.

Department	2019-20 Budget	FACT FILE	'2020-21 Proposed	'2021-22 Proposed	'2022-23 Proposed	Total	EFFICIENCY DESCRIPTION
	£'000		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	
Highways - surface dressing	800	Surface dressing is a highway maintenance treatment used extensively by all highway authorities in Wales, UK and indeed many other countries around the world. Surface Dressing treatments have been used extensively across Carmarthenshire for a number of years with great success. Surface dressing is the prescribed treatment for prolonging the life of the carriageway surface and sub-structure. The authority carries out a large programme of surface dressing works each year. The maintenance procedure which involves the application of a bitumen binder sprayed onto the carriageway surface followed by a dressing of stone seals the carriageway and restores skid resistance. This operation prevents the ingress of water into the surface and sub-structure of the carriageway and prevents degradation and formation of potholes thereby substantially prolonging the life of the carriageway. The treatment also improves the safety of road users by increasing the skid resistance properties of the road surface which assists in reducing wet skidding accidents. Many roads across the whole of Carmarthenshire have benefitted from this treatment over the past 50 years. Carmarthenshire County Council has a large network of roads to maintain and surface dressing provides a cost effective solution for keeping the roads in a safe and serviceable condition ensuring continuity for public and business travel alike.	0	300	300	600	Reduce Surface Dressing & Pre SD Patching (Offset to Capital) . The proposal is to reduce revenue spend on surface dressing and patching through offsetting revenue to capital spend, subject to a sufficient allocation of capital budget or grant.
Public Rights of Way	405	The Countryside Access Team has responsibility for the Definitive Map and Statement of Public Rights of Way in Carmarthenshire which is the conclusive legal record. Public Rights of Way include footpaths, bridleways, restricted byways and byways open to all traffic. There are urban and semi-urban routes in towns and villages but much of the 1,500 mile network is out in the countryside crossing fields, farmland and open country. It's a fantastic leisure and recreational resource for the people of Carmarthenshire and visitors to the County with the Wales Coast Path and numerous other walking/riding and cycling routes on offer. Enforcement and legal issues associated with the implementation of the Rights of way Improvement plan.	0	4	0	4	Reduce PROW Vehicles by 1
Highways - stopping up orders	0	Stopping Up Order are made when sections of the existing highway become redundant. This happens for example when a road improvement is undertaken, land within the extent of the original highway limit that has become redundant is then stopped up via a legislative process and reverts to the landowner. Where there is a formal request received from a landowner to Stop Up an area of highway land, the proposal is to charge the respective landowner the associated costs for undertaking this work.	0	5	0	5	Increase charges for Stopping Up Orders
Bridge Maintenance	532	Design, construction, maintenance and management of highway bridges and culverts.	0	0	24	24	Reduce Bridge Maintenance Revenue Budget - subject to the financial position remaining unchanged the service will be forced to reduce the level of maintenance work to reduce expenditure.
Highways	261	Suite of road condition surveys - skid resistance, deflectograph and road profile.	8	0	0	8	Remove technical surveys on unclassified roads. Unclassified roads are not included in the national performance indicator. These roads will be monitored through routine inspection.
Service reconfiguration	divisional budgets		0	100	0	100	Divisional Service Reconfiguration - subject to the financial position remaining unchanged the service will be forced to reduce the level of staffing resource with the consequential impact on service.
Road Safety	178	The Road Safety unit is responsible for delivery of road safety initiatives to meet road casualty reduction targets. The unit has responsibility for road safety education, training and publicity, the School crossing patrol service, national driver improvement schemes and road safety outside schools.	30	0	30	60	Road Safety Innovation - the service will develop income streams and sponsorship.
Public Rights of Way	405	The Countryside Access Team has responsibility for the Definitive Map and Statement of Public Rights of Way in Carmarthenshire which is the conclusive legal record. Public Rights of Way include footpaths, bridleways, restricted byways and byways open to all traffic. There are urban and semi-urban routes in towns and villages but much of the 1,500 mile network is out in the countryside crossing fields, farmland and open country. It's a fantastic leisure and recreational resource for the people of Carmarthenshire and visitors to the County with the Wales Coast Path and numerous other walking/riding and cycling routes on offer. Enforcement and legal issues associated with the implementation of the Rights of way Improvement plan.	2	10	0	12	PROW Increase income from Path Orders - the service has targeted an increase in the number of Path Orders it processes to raise income.
Fleet Maintenance	-45	Provision of maintenance to the Authority's vehicle fleet in accordance with the Authority's Operators licence statutory obligations. Costs are recovered through fixed maintenance rates.	0	0	20	20	Potential additional income from fleet maintenance - the service will look to expand the amount of chargeable work through MOT station for example
<b>Total Highways &amp; Transport division</b>			<b>500</b>	<b>649</b>	<b>427</b>	<b>1,576</b>	

**Property**

Property Maintenance	2,599	This division is responsible for the day-to-day and long term repairs & maintenance of the council's estates including schools, administrative buildings, depots etc.	56	56	54	166	Over 98% of the budget for the Property Division comprises the Revenue Maintenance Budget. Efficiencies are proposed to be met through reducing expenditure on revenue maintenance across the Council's buildings following disposal of some properties and previous capital improvements undertaken to others. We are also aiming to make savings through new procurement arrangements and seeking to in-source areas of work where it is more cost effective than using external contractors or consultants.
Divisional review	divisional budgets	-----"-----	0	50	50	100	Additional income generation based on in-house expertise available to public sector partners and other markets as appropriate.
<b>Total Property division</b>			<b>56</b>	<b>106</b>	<b>104</b>	<b>266</b>	

Department	2019-20 Budget	FACT FILE	'2020-21 Proposed	'2021-22 Proposed	'2022-23 Proposed	Total	EFFICIENCY DESCRIPTION
	£'000		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	
<b>Waste &amp; Environmental Services</b>							
Reduction Black bag waste	6,478	Targeted campaigns to reduce waste and increase the awareness and use of all recycling schemes/initiatives. It is anticipated that this will result in the diversion of waste from the residual waste stream to the recycling waste stream, thereby realising savings due to the differential in the treatment costs as set out.	35	35	35	105	Anticipated savings due to differential in gate fee between blue bag and black bag treatment as a result of proposed kerbside black bag restrictions.
Bring Sites	363	Bring sites are located across the County to provide recycling facilities within communities.. They currently cater for glass, paper and cans in the main.	8	0	0	8	Rationalisation of current Community Bring Sites at Llandovery
Bring sites - Operational	as above	-----"-----	0	0	66	66	Potential to reduce the number of service vehicles due to fewer Community Bring Sites being operated. This will be dependent on outcome of Waste Collection methodology review.
Waste Services - operational	2,784	The operational budget includes for the provision of resources, including vehicles and premises to effect the kerbside waste collection service.	0	0	200	200	Review of waste rounds and depot utilisation, subject to the conclusions of the kerbside collection methodology review.
Closed landfill Sites	236	We currently manage the ongoing aftercare at two former refuse landfill sites - Nantycaws (Phase 1) in Carmarthen and Wern Ddu in Ammanford. This includes dealing with leachate from the landfill sites and ensuring the adequacy and functionality of the infrastructure, including drainage systems.	5	0	0	5	Reduction in general routine maintenance of closed landfill sites within statutory responsibilities.
Public Conveniences	559	Operation and maintenance of Public Conveniences	200	0	0	200	Anticipated saving on current Danfo contract for the operation and cleansing of the 9 Superloos in the County. New contract prices awaited.
Cleansing	2,283	The County Council maintain over 3,500km of roads throughout the County. The Cleansing Service provides for the sweeping and de-littering of streets and footways. The service includes mechanical sweeping of highways, footways and pedestrianised town centre areas, hand litter picking and emptying bins, chewing gum removal, graffiti and illegal poster removal, clearing up illegal dumping of rubbish and dog mess. On average the County Council removes around 40 tonnes of litter every week, the equivalent of 5 elephants.	55	90	0	145	Phased rationalisation of plant (sweepers) and labour (agency), dependant of outcome of cleansing review.
Bin removal on Trunk Road	as above	-----"-----	35	0	0	35	Removal of bins on the trunk road network. Savings in servicing requirements.
Grounds Maintenance	1,210	The Grounds Maintenance Section incorporates the direct responsibility of managing and maintaining parks and playgrounds, inland water areas and a large number of public open spaces within Carmarthenshire. It also maintains grounds for many other departments of the County Council such as Social Care and Housing, Cultural Services, Education and many individual schools. The Section also has numerous external clients such as Town and Community Councils and private sports clubs.	8	0	0	8	Cease planting of spring bedding at Parc Howard. Potential for interest groups if they would wish to undertake the planting at their cost.
Grounds maintenance - Reduced sub-contractor work	as above	-----"-----	15	0	0	15	Reduce the reliance on sub-contractors through greater internal efficiencies.
Grounds Maintenance - Materials	as above	-----"-----	10	0	0	10	Efficiency through more economic use of materials used in undertaking maintenance activity.
Playground maintenance	as above	-----"-----	0	27	0	27	Redistribution of work internally due to reduction in playground service requirements and therefore making less use of agency resource.
Flood defence	329	Design, construction, maintenance and management of flood defence works. Investigation of causes of flooding.	0	0	5	5	Reduction in maintenance work on flood defence assets.
Coastal protection	81	Design and maintenance of Coastal Protection Schemes.	22	0	0	22	Reduction in budget to deal with blocked culverts and small scale repairs and cleaning work.
Income - charge for sustainable drainage advice.	193	In January 2019, under the requirements of the Flood and Water Management Act 2010 (Schedule 3) Carmarthenshire County Council become Sustainable Drainage Approving Bodies (SABs). The SAB will be required to review and approve applications for all development that have 'drainage implications' and adopt these systems once the SAB is satisfied that, if constructed, the drainage system is compliant with the sustainable drainage (SuDs) National Standards	0	10	0	10	There are already set charges for receiving and approving SuDS applications. However, there is an opportunity to charge for advice on SuDs at the pre-application stage and recover costs already expended in officer time in giving such information to external developers on sustainable drainage options - it is currently estimated that 30% of one officer's time is spent on this.
Environmental Enforcement	25	The Environmental Enforcement section is responsible for providing enforcement activity in relation to environmental crime. This includes matters relating to dog fouling, litter, fly tipping, waste carrier offences, domestic and business waste offences, abandoned vehicles, anti-social behaviour for example graffiti, highways offences and skips and scaffolding. Enforcement is effected by means of formal notices, fixed penalty fines and prosecutions.	0	30	0	30	Potential income generation and / or SLA agreements with neighbouring authorities
Review of staffing	divisional budget	The budgets that make up the management structure of the Waste and Environmental Services staffing structure.	0	0	55	55	Review management structure.
<b>Total Waste &amp; Environmental Services division</b>			<b>393</b>	<b>192</b>	<b>361</b>	<b>946</b>	
<b>Environment Total</b>			<b>981</b>	<b>987</b>	<b>892</b>	<b>2,860</b>	

Department	19-20 Budget	FACT FILE	'2020-21 Proposed	'2021-22 Proposed	'2021-22 Proposed	Total	EFFICIENCY DESCRIPTION
	£'000		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	

**Environment Department****Highways & Transport**

Highways - Eastgate Roundabout Planting	19	Grounds Maintenance Unit undertake maintenance of the roundabout at Eastgate in Llanelli. The roundabout will be planted with both spring and summer bedding plants annually. Maintenance will also include weeding of the flower beds	19	0	0	19	Highways Eastgate Roundabout Planting . Eastgate roundabout is planted with flowers every year. The service will explore options with outside organisations to fund the work. If this is unsuccessful, flower planting will cease.
Highways - Amenity Grass Cutting	36	Amenity grass cutting is undertaken on urban 30/40 mph speed roads inside towns and villages and is not undertaken on rural class roads or high speed roads. This type of cutting regime which utilises sit on or push along mowers results in a finer cut compared to the rural verge mowing operation which uses tractor mounted flail mowers. Unlike the verge mowing operation which is undertaken for safety purposes once per year , amenity grass cutting is undertaken 4 No. times throughout the summer season.	36	0	0	36	Highways Amenity Grass Cutting - grass cutting is undertaken for highway verges around major towns. The service will explore options with outside organisations. If this is unsuccessful the amenity grass cutting service will cease.
<b>Total Highways &amp; Transport division</b>			<b>55</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>55</b>	

**Waste & Environmental Services**

Household Waste recycling centres	included in total waste services budget	There are currently four HWRCs located across the County that serve all communities. The HWRCs are open 7 days a week. The waste recycled at the sites account for a significant proportion of Carmarthenshire's overall recycling performance.	0	20	0	20	Reduce opening days of Household Waste Recycling Centres at Whitland and Wernddu- reduce from 7 to 5 days a week operation, so closed 2 days in week.
Household Waste recycling centres	as above	There are currently four HWRCs located across the County that serve all communities. The HWRCs are open 7 days a week. The waste recycled at the sites account for a significant proportion of Carmarthenshire's overall recycling performance.	0	0	30	30	Reduce opening days of Household Waste Recycling Centres at Nantycaws and Trostre - reduce from 7 to 5 days a week operation, so closed 2 days in week.
Household Waste recycling centres	as above	There are currently four HWRCs located across the County that serve all communities. The HWRCs are open 7 days a week. The waste recycled at the sites account for a significant proportion of Carmarthenshire's overall recycling performance.	54	0	0	54	The Llangadog HWRC facility closed in March 2017. Part of the original budget associated with this facility has already been offered as a saving previously. The saving identified at this stage is the balance of the budget held, taking account of the mitigating measures/additional waste amnesty events for the Llandovery area.
<b>Total Waste &amp; Environmental Services division</b>			<b>54</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>104</b>	

**Environment Total**

**109                      20                      30                      159**

Department	2019-20 Budget	FACT FILE	'2020-21 Proposed	'2021-22 Proposed	'2022-23 Proposed	Total	EFFICIENCY DESCRIPTION
	£'000		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	

**Environment****Waste & Environmental Services**

Closure toilet facilities	559	Operation and maintenance of Public Conveniences	0	75	25	100	£75k is for closure of 3 units; St Clears, Town Hall (Llanelli) and Ammanford. Llanelli Bus Station site is a 4th option @£25k on the basis that these are the least used out of the 9 Superloos.
Public Conveniences - increase charge	as above	Operation and maintenance of Public Conveniences	0	23	0	23	Increase charge from 20p to 40p for Superloos.
Cemetery Charges increase (Ammanford)	17	CCC is responsible for the administration, management, and maintenance of the operational cemetery at Dyffryn Road, Ammanford.	2	0	0	2	Increasing charges for burials, memorial plaques and administrative charges by about 10 to 25%
Cessation of support to Age Cymru	20	Age Cymru provides a glass collection facility to all their members. Currently this is used by 57 households who might not be able to recycle their glass without this service.	20	0	0	20	Cessation of support to Age Cymru for glass collections in the community serving 57 clients. Service is very limited and expensive at £350 per client per annum. Reviewing options for glass collection for all households.
Whitland HWRC	included in total waste services budget	There are currently four HWRCs located across the County that serve all communities. The HWRCs are open 7 days a week. The waste recycled at the sites account for a significant proportion of Carmarthenshire's overall recycling performance.	0	80	0	80	Closure of the Whitland HWRC facility on the basis that it is the smallest of the four facilities that we have and makes the least contribution to our waste recycling targets.
Park keeping at Parc Howard	1,210	The Grounds Maintenance Section incorporates the direct responsibility of managing and maintaining parks and playgrounds, inland water areas and a large number of public open spaces within Carmarthenshire. It also maintains grounds for many other departments of the County Council such as Social Care and Housing, Cultural Services, Education and many individual schools. The Section also has numerous external clients such as Town and Community Councils and private sports clubs.	10	0	0	10	Cease formal evening presence at Parc Howard resulting in main pedestrian gate being left open at all times.
Commercial opportunity - income from Japanese Knotweed Treatment (net)	3	The grounds maintenance team arranges the treatment of Japanese Knotweed with respect to its own assets and other landownership across the Council.	0	10	0	10	Potential to treat knotweed for external clients, subject to wider corporate consideration on commercial activity that service departments can undertake.
<b>Total Waste &amp; Environmental Services division</b>			<b>32</b>	<b>188</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>245</b>	

**Environment Total****32 188 25 245**