

## Kidwelly Industrial Museum options appraisal summary

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4
Description	<b>Permanent closure of the site and disposal.</b> Disposal applies to the land and the buildings and structures. Ownership of collections at the site needs to be determined.	<b>Mothballing the site and leaving it in its current condition.</b> This is not a long-term option without a clear end goal, to either dispose or reopen the museum.	<b>Reopening the museum in its existing format with existing content.</b> This acknowledges that the previous operators of the existing offer struggled to define vision and purpose and did not manage the entire site.	<b>A reimagined 21st century version of the museum,</b> enhancing and bringing the whole site into use. Clear purpose, new interpretation theme, renewed museum content; improved visitor facilities, collection display and storage.
Economic impact	Permanently removes the option of the museum contributing to the economy of the town, county or region.	Prolongs the present situation where the museum is not positively contributing to the economy of the town, county or region. However, it allows time for enhanced business planning, operational model development, and design feasibility studies.	This option involves reviving a <i>basic offering</i> that was financially unviable by 2017 due to inadequate visitor facilities and seasonal constraints. Business growth under this option is minimal due to limited commercialisation opportunities without further investment. It might run with low costs, minimally contribute to the social and visitor economy, and yield other benefits such as reduced vandalism and antisocial behaviour. A Council subsidy will be required to employ staff and operational costs.	Good quality museums contribute to reasons for visitors to extend their stay in an area, which positively impacts the broader economy. Reopening with a robust and knowledgeable approach to best practices in the industrial museum sector and enhancing visitor offerings for extended visits increases Carmarthenshire's appeal as a holiday spot. It creates local jobs for museum staff. Construction work and exhibit conservation will generate employment. Additionally, the infrastructure will support local revenue-generating partnerships, such as the successful cafe, Stacey's Kitchen, at Carmarthenshire Museum & the Bishop's Park. A Council subsidy will be required to employ staff and operational costs.
Financial impact	Restrictions of listed buildings, scheduled monuments, land contamination, invasive plant species and known flood risk, represent significant constraints on the commercial sale opportunities for the land. The market for existing museum sites in the private sector is negligible. The CCC collection store will need new premises and cost of relocating.	Mothballing pushes costs into the future and the risk of inflation rendering works unaffordable. Requirement to improve safety and security during mothballing period (i.e. not a "do nothing" option). Implementing the recommendations of the Designing Out Crime Officer and Health & Safety Advisor through a process of property and system repairs. Deferred costs of repairing the buildings in accordance with the findings of the 2022 property condition survey, and deterioration of the large objects located outside. Mothballing preparation works would need to be carried out before any option to reopen the site; costs could potentially be factored into business planning and future income generation.	Museum closed in 2017 on safety grounds and there has been no improvement on that situation. All the cost headings identified in option 2 apply. Opportunities for external funding for core maintenance costs may be unsuccessful placing the burden on CCC. Some income generation is anticipated through ticketed admissions but annual visits previously stood at 2,000. A Business Plan should be developed prior to commitment to reopening, considering prior visitor attendances and availability of visitor facilities.	The cost heading identified in option 2, Mothballing, will apply as a basis for moving forward from the present position. Option 4 sets out a dynamic vision that is socially focussed, globally relevant, and delivering a sustainable outcome. Reimagining the whole site could overcome some known challenges, such as car parking, and grow the visitor destination. On this basis, more opportunities for external funding should be available. Competition for grants is high as core funding is cut across culture budgets. Some match funding from the parent company is inevitably a grant condition, to demonstrate a commitment to the scheme. A new governance model helps to secure long term financial future. Long term utility costs will be minimal. A Business Plan should be developed prior to commitment to reopening.
Social impact	Disposal diminishes cultural heritage offer in the county	Mothballing prolongs the loss of access to a nationally significant cultural heritage offer.	Restoring full access to the site for public benefit.	Reopening museum will be a positive outcome for the community of Kidwelly that wants it to reopen. A people centred museum, providing learning, research and skills training. Expanding the perception of what the current museum offers as a top class destination, reimagined as a centre for education and opportunities for young people to shape and take forward the vision. This option supports the Curriculum for Wales and could deliver benefits defined in the Social Value Act.
Ecological impact	Preliminary Ecological Assessment indicates likelihood of presence of protected species and habitats on site. Any development requires further ecology assessment and consultation with NRW.	Prior to any essential repairs, further ecological assessments will be a planning requirement.	Prior to any essential repairs, further ecological assessments will be a planning requirement.	Prior to any essential repairs, further ecological assessments will be a planning requirement. This proposal introduces a boardwalk along riverbanks, through wooded habitats, and the Lower Works to access the natural environment. The reclamation of the post-industrial site by nature will be a feature of the visitor experience.

<b>Historic and cultural impact</b>	Restrictions associated with 4 listed buildings and two areas of scheduled monument. Any development will require approval of statutory consultees, and appropriate consents.	Mothballing preserves the site and collections for future use but it prolongs the loss of access to the site. This option focuses on protecting collections, monuments and buildings, to reduce further deterioration or permanent loss.	Reopening will return the listed buildings and collections to a stable condition; investment in their care will preserve them for the long term. Scheduled Monuments will be appropriately cared for, monitored, and maintained. Existing interpretation panels could be reused in the short term; these focus on the industrial processes and the people who worked there. Restoration and conservation of objects is facilitated by reopening and planned into future funding applications and capital expenditure programmes, simply to sustain the collection in its present format.	Reopening will return the listed buildings and collections to a stable condition; investment in their care will preserve them for the long term. Scheduled Monuments will be appropriately cared for, monitored, and maintained. Creatively upgrading an existing museum store to solve a collections storage crisis. Reconnecting the two parts of the site to open up as a 12-acre museum and heritage wildlife experience. Expanding the knowledge and understanding of the site and its history, placing the development of tinplate within the global context of changing market demand for tinplate at home and abroad; British trade, shipping and imperial expansion; sources of raw materials; and international flows of ideas concerning technologies and designs; the history and role of the Kidwelly works, an early pioneer of tinplate working in Wales, and its volatile history over two centuries (1737- 1944), illustrating the potential profitability as well as the pitfalls of the industry as a whole, and its impact on working lives, consumers and manufacturers in Wales and much further afield.
<b>Flood risk</b>	Flood risk mapping of Afon Gwendraeth includes Lower Works area within flood plain; NRW mapping shows existing buildings to be medium to high risk of flooding from surface water and local watercourses. Land available for development is severely restricted and nature of development is also restricted (e.g. no high risk or vulnerable use).	This option could factor in long term adaptation of the site to long range flood risk.	There will be no investment in flood prevention to reopen because half of the site will remain inaccessible. The site will be managed with internal services and in collaboration with Cadw and NRW to reduce the risk and impact of flooding when it happens. The impact of flooding in the upper works could lead to site closure and impact on the stored collections. A Flood Consequences Assessment is recommended to determine short, mid and long-term options.	A Flood Consequences Assessment will be essential to develop a plan to protect the visitor access along the eastern bank of the river that will provide full access around the site, and to avoid future erosion of the Scheduled Lower Works area.
<b>Environmental risk</b>	Site contains several areas that are Habitats of Principal Importance for Conservation of Biological Diversity under section 7 of the Environment (Wales) Act 2016. Several areas can be included as Open Mosaic Habitats on Previously Developed Land and also be considered a Habitat of Principal Importance. Japanese Knotweed present on the site. Disposal of the site will need consider the risk of any future developments on habitat loss.	Infestation of invasive plant species could lead to risk of legal challenge from neighbouring residential properties/land-owners.	Eradicating invasive plant species will benefit the long term ecological health of the site. It will also add some protection to buildings near infected areas. It is recommended that invasive plant species be removed from site prior to reopening. Any property repairs will require appropriate ecological surveys to be completed to support planning applications. The cost and timing of these will be factored into reopening plans.	Eradicating invasive plant species will benefit the long term ecological health of the site. It will also add some protection to buildings near infected areas. It is recommended that invasive plant species be removed from site prior to reopening. Any property repairs will require appropriate ecological surveys to be completed to support planning applications. The cost and timing of these will be factored into reopening plans.
<b>Sustainability</b>	N/A	This option does not include any environmental, social, nor financial sustainability goals.	<b>Electricity:</b> existing wiring has failed. This option reconnects to the grid, prioritising basic safety but does not seek to improve commercial opportunities or visitor experience, in an effort to keep power consumption costs to a minimum. <b>Water:</b> changes to statutory requirements for disposal of surface and foul water have changed since the site was developed. Steps to comply with the new requirements will need investigating. Existing WCs facilities are very poor condition, presenting an opportunity for rainwater harvesting to reduce water consumption.	<b>Electricity:</b> This option proposes an approach entirely self-sufficient in energy generation, which should be a high priority. Possibilities include hydro-electric generation, photovoltaic solar panels on existing buildings and over car parking, and wind turbine. This will be a core focus of the museum offer, where the adoption of sustainable energy production is within the learning programmes. <b>Water:</b> Rainwater harvesting and use of grey water for flushing.
<b>Property</b>	No property maintenance undertaken since museum closure in 2017. Atkins 2022 property condition survey sets out the known defects for those buildings/ structures that were surveyed. Electrical installation condemned - no power on site. Water disconnected due to water leaks and prohibitive cost of repair. No working office or welfare facilities.	Addresses urgent building repair issues. Protects property from vandalism and antisocial behaviour. Reduces risk of enforcement notice from Cadw to repair all listed buildings and to protect scheduled monuments.	Most buildings will not be upgraded to be environmentally efficient, with utilities restored on a like-for-like basis. Currently no installed systems for fire detection or warning, intruder detection, CCTV, or ICT. A risk assessment prior to reopening will determine whether powered systems are necessary for public protection. There will remain no heating. Listed buildings and monuments will undergo essential repair only, but this could be phased and some undertaken while visitors are on site. Other properties will be made weathertight. Thermal insulation of Collection Store is a minimum upgrade to mitigate the cost of further deterioration of artefacts. Site fence will need to be reinstated (700m), and clearance of vegetation along perimeter. Basic security of buildings to be installed and CCTV to be considered. Visitor facilities will need to be developed.	Site and building security will need to be planned and put in place as a first step. Repairs of existing listed/high priority buildings to make safe or avoid increased costs by delaying further. Enhancements of buildings will take place to improve thermal efficiency, installation of heating, repairs to windows and doors, LED lighting, etc., making the buildings available for a range of activities. Replacement of toilet block and Portakabin reception building. Redesign car parking to increase capacity, incorporating EV charging points served by site electricity generating solutions and supporting active travel options. Option to introduce a vibrant local cafe business into the site in either a new-build visitor centre or adapted existing building.

<b>Collections storage</b>	Site disposal will include loss of 314m2 museum collection store. Collection storage has been the focus for the museum service since 2017 but the goal has not been achieved due to costs. This option will require a suitable new store for large and boxed objects, including rent, charges and adaptation costs.	Existing museum store is retained and would need basic improvements to create a safe working environment and reduce rate of deterioration. The long term future for the site needs to be decided, to determine the appropriate course of action for the artefacts on site (i.e. preparing for relocation if disposing of the site, or preparing for long term preservation on site if reopening).	The collection store will be made weathertight and thermal insulation of buildings where artefacts are kept will slow the deterioration that has occurred from being kept in poor conditions.	This option proposes including part of the Collection Store (the large objects) within the visitor experience as a guided tour offer, once the store building has been adapted to this and the content reconfigured. It also suggests large object conservation by engineers (e.g. the locomotives) as an activity that visitors can observe and volunteers could support.
<b>Visitor facilities</b>	N/A	N/A	<b>Car parking:</b> current provision is limited to approx. 6-10 vehicles on grassed area liable to churn up (suitable for use only in dry conditions). <b>WCs, visitor reception:</b> Consideration should be given to replacing or renewing the toilet block and the visitor reception, to get them operational on a short-term basis while a longer term plan is developed. <b>Other enhancements:</b> sealing gaps around roofs/ doors/ windows; replacing decayed windows and doors; insulating roofs to improve thermal performance; instal LED lights; harvest and re-use rainwater; redecorate; instal heating.	Car parking offer is redesigned, providing EV charging powered on site, and active travel options. New visitor centre developed, either as a new build or adapting an existing building, providing ticket office and shop, WCs, café, and learning space. All properties are renewed on a phased basis according to a new masterplan, presenting opportunities for an engaging experience, including spaces to learn, train, make, eat and drink, get married, watch performances, etc.
<b>Project management</b>	Disposal of property is a legal and corporate property matter, involving property assets owned by CCC and Kidwelly Industrial Museum Trust, ensuring compliance with any funders. Disposal and/or relocation of County Council owned collections is the responsibility of the museum service with legal advice and in accordance with UK accreditation standard. Other assets owned by other organisations, including Kidwelly Industrial Museum Trust, will need ownership to be determined and a return plan agreed.	Property design will oversee the planning processes and capital repair works due to the anticipated costs. Museums collections management remains with museum service.	Property design will oversee the planning processes and capital repair works due to the anticipated costs. Business planning, site management, and collections management remains with museum service.	A major project that will require internal and external stakeholder engagement to adopt a long term site masterplan. Internal collaboration with the grants team, property design, regeneration, education, and legal. External collaboration with project funders.
<b>Resources</b>	Listed property will require maintenance to enable property disposal. Some collections ownership is under question, requiring a due diligence exercise to confirm. A resourced rationalisation programme is recommended. Moving collections from the site will require: project officer and assistant, full time for 18-24 months. Provision on site of a work space with power, lighting and heating, IT connectivity, and welfare facilities. Cost of professional conservation of artefacts being returned to lenders. Re-packing collection because existing material are contaminated. Museum artefact insurance. Transportation and logistics of setting up a new store.	Listed property will require maintenance to stabilise for mothballing. Some collections ownership is under question, requiring a due diligence exercise to confirm. A resourced rationalisation programme is recommended. Additional mothballing costs estimate, 700m security fence, architect fees to support planning application for property repairs, essential property repairs (Atkins 2022), knotweed treatment (3 yrs). This does not include a cost allowance for maintenance on the museum collection store, which is currently unacceptable.	Initial reopening costs include business planning, flood consequences assessment, security fencing, listed building planning application, essential property repairs, treating invasive plants, preparing collections for reopening, object conservation, appointing staff. Provision should also be made for rewiring, installing fire safety and other systems, and repairing the collection store.	Costs include business planning, legal fees, ecology and flood assessments, site security, reinstating power during works, design team/architect fees, flood protection works, demolition of redundant buildings and erect new, car park upgrades, fit out of priority buildings to support activity programmes, collection store repairs and conservation of collections. The site can reopen as a "work in progress" that can form part of the visitor experience, once a certain baseline has been achieved (e.g. site made safe, visitor facilities provided). The Business Plan will assess realistic long-term operational costs and viability.
<b>Costs</b>	Property maintenance estimate £395k-£495k. // Revenue over 2 years to manage property disposal and relocation of collections £360k. <b>Estimated total £655k-£755k.</b>	Property maintenance and security estimate £815k-£915k. // Revenue over 2 years £281 to rationalise and mothball collections and develop long-term business plan. <b>Estimated total cost £1.1m-£1.2m.</b>	Property repairs to basic reopening condition estimate £891k-£991k. // Revenue over 2 years for reopening a basic offer is £412k. <b>Estimated total cost £1.3m-£1.4m.</b>	Property repairs and adaptations could range from £2.5m to £2.9m, depending on when the project starts. Renewing the exhibition estimated at £1.3m. <b>Estimated capital costs for first phase opening is £4.2m.</b>
<b>Finance</b>	Museum service budget for Kidwelly Industrial Museum is £23k, for security, grounds maintenance, and utility standing charges only. A budget uplift would be required for the disposal project, to include staff salaries, property repairs to create a space to work on site, and the other project costs. The ongoing costs of a new collection store, including commercial rent, business rates, and utilities will need a revenue growth; and one-off costs for property adaptations and fit-out will also need to be factored.	Revenue allocation to support costs for property condition assessment for key strategic buildings not assessed by Atkins in 2022, and to prepare planning application for essential repairs. Capital allocation for security fence and essential repairs. Likelihood of successful application for external funding for property maintenance costs is low, unless as part of a long term re-opening plan.	A Business Plan is advised prior to a commitment to reopening, as a basis for revenue support based on a realistic operational model and income targets within the constraints of the site. Existing revenue budget is insufficient to support development activities. CCC capital allocation for security fence and essential repairs will need to be secured. External funding may contribute some restoration costs where a corporate commitment to development at this museum can be demonstrated aligned to the funder's investment priorities.	A Business Plan is advised prior to a commitment to reopening. Consideration to be given to the development match-funding necessary to support a major grant application (e.g. business planning, activity plan, flood consequences assessment, heritage impact assessment, internal design fees, ecology survey), typically a minimum of 10% cash for local authorities. Long-term operational financial viability must be understood to determine levels of local authority revenue support.
<b>Policy</b>	Does not actively support the Leisure Business Strategy and Cabinet Vision Statement.	Does not actively support the Leisure Business Strategy and Cabinet Vision Statement, unless as part of a planned commitment to reopen.	Partially supports the Leisure Business Strategy and Cabinet Vision Statement to have a plan for the site.	Fully supports Leisure Business Strategy and Cabinet Vision Statement. Supports the Corporate Strategy thematic priority "Welsh language and culture", and national Well-Being Goals. Supports the Council's Transformation Strategy to decarbonise and to develop a more commercial approach. Aligns with the Council's Ten Towns initiative. Addresses the challenges of reducing numbers of families and young people in Carmarthenshire identified in the Moving Rural Carmarthenshire Forward report.

<b>Operation and Governance</b>	N/A	N/A	Managed under CofGâr with internal SLAs, including flood prevention, ecology, grounds maintenance.	Building on what we do well, which is working in partnership. Proposing a new model for governance between the local authority and a charity: retaining site management and operation with Carmarthenshire County Council; setting up a charity specifically for the advancement of education through training in heritage skills and promoting an appreciation in the historical context and preservation of the Kidwelly Tinplate Works; and the advancement of heritage, community and citizenship through the creation and dissemination of research on Kidwelly Tinplate Works, its legacy, global relevance, and legacy. Developing a youth panel model to support young trustees on to the board, providing training such as understanding charity finance, the charity trustee role, etc
<b>Recommendation</b>	Not considered a viable option.	This is a viable option but not as a standalone approach to the long term future of the site.	This is a viable option but is not considered a long term standalone approach to the future of the museum.	This is a viable option and is considered a potential long term stand-alone approach to the future of the museum.